

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Planning & Strategy Committee Meeting Part I Public, held in the Elwood Room, Conference & Function Centre, 354 Main Street, Palmerston North on 12 August 2020, commencing at 9.02am

- Members Present:** Councillor Aleisha Rutherford (in the Chair), The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan and Bruno Petrenas.
- Non Members:** Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison and Karen Naylor.
- Apologies:** Councillors Susan Baty (early departure), Lew Findlay and Tangi Utikere (lateness).

Councillor Tangi Utikere entered the meeting at 9.12am during consideration of clause 22. He was not present for clause 21.

21-20 Apologies

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The COMMITTEE RESOLVED

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 21-20 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

22-20 Hearing of Submissions - Future Use of Huia Street Reserve

The following people appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of their submission and replied to questions from Elected Members.

Alec and Lynne Mackay (67):

Mr Alec Mackay spoke to their submission and made the additional following comments:

- As residents of Park Road and Palmerston North, great to see some action by Council.
- The area has been left unattended, uncared for and inaccessible for far too long.
- Traffic is very busy in the mornings around that area.
- Support Options 3 and 4 and are opposed to Options 1, 2 and 5.

- The Huia Street Reserve should be developed for recreational, cultural or community purposes.

Councillor Tangi Utikere entered the meeting at 9.12am.

Railway Land Action Group (6):

Mr Bruce and Mrs Marilyn Bulloch spoke to the submission and made the additional following comments:

- They have been lobbying for the preservation of public green space in Palmerston North since 1992. Too often the public green spaces are seen as being a convenient source of revenue but once you have lost these spaces, they are gone for good and never replaced.
- The reserve used to be part of the Esplanade complex, which once had a use, being the site of the Bowling Club rooms, but due to a deliberate ploy by this Council through its actions and inactions the land is now seen as derelict.
- Five options and analysis were presented for the public to comment on, but the consultation document is highly biased towards the Council's preferred option of enabling the sale or development of the land for housing.
- Many people have commented on the unsuitability of the site for housing given the nature of the extremely congested corner site, congested by both heavy traffic volume and by surrounding houses. They know there is pressure on available land for housing purposes due to many causes, but there should be no reason to sacrifice valuable public parks.

Marilyn & Bruce Bulloch (7):

Mr Bruce and Mrs Marilyn Bulloch spoke to their submission and made the additional following comments:

- Recently visited the reserve on 31 July and found the site as derelict as ever. They noticed the terrible racket from the continuous stream of traffic on the corner of the land adjoining Fitzherbert Avenue. Also an unseen health hazard at this site with the air being polluted from vehicles.
- In their support for Option 4 they envisioned a possible landscaping scenario for the area. They thought the theme of displaying a multitude of Camellia varieties could be carried from the Esplanade Rose Garden through to the Huia Street Reserve as they grow well here and provide shelter.
- The existing Totara trees could be retained along the Park Road boundary to provide shelter and more could be planted. The corner site could be used to plant Heritage roses in plots, which could also be viewed from the roadway.
- The rear of the site could be planted in a more rustic manner, with an emphasis on features that appeal to young children in particular.
- Any sale of this reserve land in this long established neighbourhood would deprive the local residents of an asset.
- People need to be aware that any proceeds from a possible sale of the Huia

Street lots are required by legislation to be spent on acquiring other reserves or for the development of other reserves. Some people think that you can just use this money to cut rates.

Environment Network Manawatu (9):

Ms Stewart Harrex and Mr Alastair Cole spoke to the submission and made the additional following comments:

- There are 47 submissions in favour of obtaining reserve status and public ownership and 29 in favour of housing with two appearing to want both and two wanting neither. This would suggest that those who recognise Huia Street, as no one they have spoken to knows where it was, are sending a clear message to Council. They believed if the land had been called Fitzherbert and Park Road corners there may have been many more submissions.
- People are not happy that since 2002 the land has been neglected.
- Enough reserve land has been whittled away and they have high hopes for the site, as shown in the many suggestions in the submissions.
- They believed the people of Palmerston North will not tolerate any further action towards removing the reserve status.
- They have envisaged an interesting, welcoming and sheltered place suited to rest and discovery that would be fitting to a city of 90,000 people, which identifies as an eco-city.
- Council needs to have faith in the community and in the artistic and talented people in it. The Council could workshop the many ideas that people have and Environment Network Manawatu members would be very pleased to be active in that process.

Manawatu Tenants Union (58):

Mr Ben Schmidt spoke to the submission and made no additional comments.

Chris Teo-Sherrell (62):

Mr Chris Teo-Sherrell spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

Manawatu Lawn Tennis Club (78):

Mr Andy Martin spoke to the submission and made the additional following comments:

- The development of housing could put the tennis club under threat and they would like assurance from the Council that the tennis club lease is secured.
- Suggested an indoor sports centre on the site to use along with other sporting codes, which would provide the tennis club with a long term future.
- If the site was used for housing, the new tenants would be faced with noise, lights and tennis balls and the traffic would get worse.
- Biggest concern is certainty of lease for the tennis club and the potential for them to grow.

Palmerston North Girls High School (75):

Mr Troy Gerbich spoke to the submission and made no additional comments.

The meeting adjourned at 10.35am.

The meeting resumed at 10.55am.

Fiona Wilson (76):

Ms Fiona Wilson spoke to her submission and made the additional following comments:

- Concern was raised about the lack of community consultation who are affected by the proposal.
- Support Palmerston North Girls High School and Environmental Network Group's submissions.
- Big concern with the traffic congestion and any housing development on this corner is only going to add further congestion to the area and fail to see how the risks can be mitigated if it goes ahead.
- Considers the concept of multi-storey apartments to be totally out of kilter with the most attractive entrance to the city. No matter how flash a new apartment building might be, over time they date and look tired.
- Would lose an opportunity for a green space, which we will not get back.

James Owen (25):

Mr James Owen spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

John Bent (65):

Mr John Bent spoke to his submission and made the additional following comments:

- A consequence of extra housing is extra energy required to supply the needs of the residents of those houses. Why does Palmerston North need more houses? More houses mean more energy required. Where is that extra energy going to come from? So a proposal for housing will impose an environmental disbenefit on New Zealand and the world.
- Housing is not supported by majority of the community of Palmerston North as represented in the submissions.

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Rachel Bowen.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Planning & Strategy Committee hear submissions from presenters who indicated their wish to be heard in support of their submission.
2. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 22-20 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel

Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

23-20 The Future Use of Huia Street Reserve: Summary of Submissions
Memorandum, presented by David Murphy, City Planning Manager.

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Summary of Submissions attached to the memorandum entitled “The Future Use of Huia Street Reserve: Summary of Submissions” reported to the 12 August 2020 Planning and Strategy Committee be received.

Clause 23-20 above was carried 14 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

Abstained:

Councillor Lorna Johnson.

24-20 Deputation - Homes for People

Mr Vaughan Dennison and Mr Darren Birch, founder of Homes for People, made a deputation providing a summary of their work for Homes for People.

Darren and Cheri Birch are the founders of Homes for People who have 30 years’ experience working and living with people who cannot access the resources required to be a New Zealand homeowner. There is a barrier that many people face with entering the housing market here in the community, both in homeownership and the rental housing market.

Just short of three years ago they dug their first hole, which is thanks to many people in the community:

- Investors;
- Corporate partners who have joined with them, discounted products and supported them;
- Central Energy Trust who had supported them in their first project;
- And many others.

They deliver transitional housing where they are now managing 71 units on behalf of the community including people who are vulnerable and people who have high and complex needs.

Homes for People have now completed 13 new build homes, have 5 homes under construction, 26 homes going through design consent process, about 9

areas of land acquired and 20 plus going through joint venture discussions.

The biggest demand is for one or two bedroom houses so what they offer is market affordable low cost housing under \$350,000 for a two bedroom house.

They would love to work with the City Council, Central Government and Iwi, specifically working with the City Council on the new Whakarongo development for assisted ownership, social housing and whatever way they can assist the Council.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Planning & Strategy Committee receive the deputation for information.

Clause 24-20 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

Note:

Councillor Vaughan Dennison declared a conflict of interest and withdrew from discussion and voting on clause 24-20.

25-20

Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Patrick Handcock ONZM, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the Planning & Strategy Committee meeting of 10 June 2020 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 25-20 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

26-20

Deliberations on Submissions to the Amendment to the Cemeteries and Crematorium Bylaw 2018

Report, presented by Julie Macdonald, Strategy and Policy Manager.

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Council approves the Amendment to the Cemeteries and

Crematorium Bylaw 2018 by specifically revoking clause 11.7 as stated on Attachment 1 to the report titled "Deliberations on Submissions to the Amendment to the Cemeteries and Crematorium Bylaw 2018".

Clause 26-20 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

27-20

Review of the Trade Waste Bylaw 2015 - S155 Determination

Report, presented by Julie Macdonald - Manager Strategy & Policy.

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That pursuant to s 155(1) of the Local Government Act 2002, the Council determines that a bylaw is the most appropriate way of addressing the perceived problem of regulating the quality and rate of trade waste discharges.
2. That pursuant to s 155(2)(a) of the Local Government Act 2002, the Council determines that a standalone bylaw is the most appropriate form for a trade waste bylaw.
3. That pursuant to s 155(2)(b) of the Local Government Act 2002, the Council agrees that it is not anticipated that a revised bylaw would give rise to any implications under the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990.
4. That the Chief Executive be instructed to draft a revised Trade Waste Bylaw which addresses the perceived problem of regulating the quality and rate of trade waste discharges.

Clause 27-20 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

28-20

Transport Portfolio Update (August 2020)

Memorandum, presented by Councillor Brent Barrett.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Transport Portfolio update report for August 2020 be received for information.

Clause 28.1 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

2. That a plan to deliver pedestrian network improvements be referred to the 2021 Long Term Plan process.

Clause 28.2 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

Note:

On a motion "That a plan to deliver pedestrian network improvements be developed by the Chief Executive and presented to Council within six months". The motion was lost 4 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Zulfiqar Butt, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan and Tangi Utikere.

29-20 Committee Work Schedule

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Planning & Strategy Committee receive its Work Schedule dated August 2020.

Clause 29-20 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Aleisha Rutherford, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Tangi Utikere.

The meeting finished at 12.21pm.

Confirmed 9 September 2020

Chairperson