

# PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the Extraordinary Community Development Committee Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 10 December 2020, commencing at 9.08am.**

**Members Present:** Councillors Lorna Johnson (in the Chair), Rachel Bowen, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas, and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Non Members:** Councillor Vaughan Dennison.

**Apologies:** The Mayor (Grant Smith) (on Council business), Councillors Rachel Bowen (early departure on Council business) and Leonie Hapeta, and Ms Danielle Harris.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 10.57am during consideration of clause 52. She was not present for clause 52.

Councillor Patrick Handcock ONZM declared an interest in clause 50 and left the table during consideration of clause 50.

## **49-20 Apologies**

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Susan Baty.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 49-20 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Lorna Johnson, Rachel Bowen, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Vaughan Dennison.

## **50-20 Hearing of Submissions - Draft Local Alcohol Policy 2020**

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Community Development Committee hear submissions from presenters who indicated their wish to be heard in support of their submission.
2. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as

described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 50-20 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Lorna Johnson, Rachel Bowen, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Vaughan Dennison.

**Note:**

Councillor Patrick Handcock ONZM declared a conflict of interest and withdrew from discussion and voting on clause 50-20 above.

The following persons appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members.

**New Zealand Police Manawatu (20)**

Inspector Ross Grantham (Prevention Manager Manawatu) spoke to the Police's submission and made the following additional comments:

- The Safety Advisory Board supports the submissions made by the Police.
- The issue suggested by supermarket and bottle store conglomerates advising that pre-loaders buy their alcohol from bottle stores rather than supermarkets is disingenuous. His experience in dealing with pre-loaders has shown that alcohol was bought either from bottle stores or supermarkets.
- Relating to the proposal to reduce trading hours of on-licences, Inspector Grantham advised that even 60 minutes can save people and our community from becoming victims of alcohol abuse.

**MidCentral District Health Board's Public Health Service (25)**

Representing the Public Health Service Unit of the MidCentral District Health Board and as Medical Officer of Health, Dr Rob Weir spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- As stated in the overall conclusion of Professor Connor's publication, modest changes in closing hours would have clear beneficial effects rather than a the reduction in opening hours.
- Speaking on behalf of his emergency department colleagues, Dr Weir advised that there were implications of closing hours on the number of attendances.
- Acknowledged that Council must strike a balance between commercial interests and health concerns. However, the object of the Sale and Supply of Alcohol Act is not commercial interests.

**Te Hiringa Hauora Health Promotion Agency (21)**

Ms Cathy Bruce (Principal Advisor Local Government) spoke to the Agency's submission and made the following additional comments:

- Research shows that people's drinking behaviour is influenced by their local environment. Communities can do a great deal to reduce local alcohol related harm. Councils play a crucial role in encouraging a change in drinking behaviour in their communities.
- Encouraged Council to keep the Sale and Supply of Alcohol Act objectives in mind when making decisions. Policy decisions based on economic concerns have no place in the Local Alcohol Policy.
- The local data around the number of bottle stores located in high deprivation areas raises a further concern that Council should consider location of premises as part of the Local Alcohol Policy.

**Fish Bar Limited (27), Celtic Inn (28) and PR Attractions Ltd (Bubbles Bar) (29)**

Mr Chris Hince, assisting Gary Wright (owner), spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- Noted that Brewers Apprentice, The Cobb, The Daily and Trader McKendry's owners, although they did not make a submission, endorse Mr Wright's presentation.
- Professional bar owners and employees are the least interested in having bad behaviour, intoxication or violence occurring in their establishments.
- On-licenced venues are safer places to consume alcohol since they are supervised environments, with trained staff to assist and reduce the amount of potential harm.
- Opposed the one-way door policy because there is not substantial research or information around effectiveness of such restriction. It could be problematic as people outside are separated from their group and become potentially vulnerable. The situation could result in anger, violence, vandalism, and risky actions.
- If the one-way door policy is applied, Mr Hince requested mechanisms in the policy to deal with the issues, to police the situation.
- Night life in Palmerston North is currently starting around 11.00pm or later.
- It is unrealistic to think that bars operate at a loss during the last hour.

Mr Gary Wright also spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- In relation to the one-way door restrictions, Mr Wright pointed out the need for research and discussions around how to minimise impacts on the street with people congregating.
- In the current situation the bars may be closed progressively as a way to manage people leaving establishments.
- Questioned if there would be enough infrastructure, such as cabs, if all the venues close at 2.00am.
- Suggested that Council should do its own research instead of relying on statistics from other cities.
- Vandalism in night life area in the city is not necessarily related to bars'

- operations between 2.00am and 3.00am.
- Invited Council's staff and Elected Members involved in the matter to attend the meetings held by the network of bar owners for further engagement, and to visit the establishments to see how they operate.
- This year has been difficult for the industry, however Mr Wright managed to retain all their staff.
- There are other ways to reduce alcohol harm, such as education programmes.

### **FoodStuffs North Island Limited (23)**

Mr Iain Thain (Solicitor – DLA Piper Law Firm) spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- Evidence shows that the average sale of alcohol from off-licensed premises in Palmerston North from 8.00pm to 11.00pm is lower than the national average. That local evidence does not support differing from the national default hours.
- Professor Connor's research paper mentioned by other submitters was based around the introduction of the national default hours which affected both off-licence hours and on-licence hours. By contrast, in New South Wales, there was an experiment done where only off-licence hours were reduced in country New South Wales, and the effect of that resulted in an increase in the number of non-domestic assaults. In downtown Sydney, only on-licence hours were reduced, and that had a positive impact on alcohol related harm.
- According to the Officers' Report, there is local evidence that purchasing for pre-loading takes place prior to 9.00pm and mostly from liquor stores instead of supermarkets.
- Supported continuing with the default hours for off-licences (7.00am to 11.00pm), and in particular to any specific off-licensed premises, the District Licensing Committee at its discretion would determine the appropriate hours, restricting them if there is reasonable basis to do so.

### **General Distributors Limited (22)**

Mr Paul Radich spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- The business training standard related to the provision of alcohol is higher than the obligations under the Act.
- The four stores operating in the city have not failed to fulfil any of the provisions of the Act.
- Does not support the suggested shift to 9.00pm stating that the reason for the reduction of hours is not clear. The Officer's Report mentioned that people usually buy alcohol to pre-load prior to 9.00pm. There are other tools and mechanisms to address anti-social behaviour.
- Encouraged the Council to deal with problematic premises rather than

applying a blanket rule.

### **Alcohol Healthwatch (30)**

Nathan Cowie (Health Promotion Advisor) spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- The last hour of trading whether in a supermarket or a bottle store, a bar or a night club, might bring private profits but it comes with costs affecting the community. A Local Alcohol Policy is not a tool for economic development, though reduction in alcohol harm will have economic benefits through less cancers, injuries, emergency department presentations, violence, sexual assaults, and burden on police and emergency services.
- Supported Council developing wider alcohol harm reduction strategies beyond local alcohol policies. Invited Council to think beyond licensing issues, including advertising, marketing and sponsorship and to contribute to national discussions around the price of alcohol.
- Suggested the creation of a prevention group composed of Police, Health Services, Local Government and stakeholders.
- Encouraged Council to put health before profits, and community interests ahead of commercial interest.

### **Hospitality New Zealand PN (14)**

Mr Adam Parker (Regional Manager) and Mrs Colleen Maxwell (Palmerston North Branch President) spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

## **51-20 Confirmation of Minutes**

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the Community Development Committee meeting of 4 November 2020 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 51-20 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Lorna Johnson, Rachel Bowen, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Vaughan Dennison.

## **52-20 Draft Local Alcohol Policy - Summary of Submissions**

Memorandum, presented by Julie Macdonald - Strategy and Policy Manager.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 10.57am.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the report titled 'Draft Local Alcohol Policy - Summary of Submissions' presented to the Community Development Committee on 10 December 2020 be received for information.

Clause 52-20 above was carried 11 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Lorna Johnson, Rachel Bowen, Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Vaughan Dennison.

**Abstained:**

Councillor Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The meeting finished at 10.58am

Confirmed 17 March 2021

**Chairperson**