

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Finance & Audit Committee Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 26 May 2021, commencing at 9.03am

- Members Present:** Councillor Susan Baty (in the Chair), The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.
- Non Members:** Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

Councillor Lew Findlay left the meeting at 12.26pm after consideration of clause 41. He was not present for clauses 42 to 44 inclusive.

38-21 Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the Finance & Audit Committee meeting of 28 April 2021 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 38-21 above was carried 16 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Abstained:

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

39-21 Assurance Report on Review of COVID-19 Expenditure

Memorandum, presented by Masooma Akhter, Business Assurance Manager.

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the memorandum titled 'Assurance Report on Review of COVID-19 Expenditure' and its attachment, presented to the Finance & Audit Committee on 26 May 2021, be received for information.

Clause 39-21 above was carried 17 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie

Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

- 40-21 Assurance Report on Review of Community Grants and Events Funding**
Memorandum, presented by Masooma Akhter, Business Assurance Manager and Sheryl Bryant, Acting GM Marketing and Communications.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the memorandum titled 'Assurance Report on Review of Community Grants and Events Funding' and its attachment, presented to the Finance & Audit Committee on 26 May 2021, be received for information.

Clause 40-21 above was carried 13 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Lew Findlay QSM, Leonie Hapeta and Billy Meehan.

The meeting adjourned at 10.09am.

The meeting resumed at 10.30am.

- 41-21 Review of the Elected Members' Expenses and Allowances Policy 2021, and the Elected and Appointed Members' Professional Development & Training Policy 2021**
Memorandum, presented by Hannah White, Democracy & Governance Manager.

During discussion Elected Members requested that Standing Order 2.12.11 be suspended, and proposed several amendments to the policies.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Rachel Bowen.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Standing Order 2.12.11 be suspended for the debate on this report.

Clause 41-21 above was carried 14 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Against:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

2. That Council approve the Elected and Appointed Members' Expenses and Allowances Policy 2021 as attached (Attachment 1), subject to approval of the Remuneration Authority, as amended.
3. That Council approve the Elected and Appointed Members' Professional Development and Training Policy 2021 as attached (Attachment 2), as amended.

Clauses 41-21 and 41.3-21 above were carried 17 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

4. That all expense claims by Elected Members are reported annually to the Finance and Audit Committee.

Clause 41-21 above was carried 17 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Renee Dingwall, seconded Lorna Johnson.

5. That 'Te Tiriti o Waitangi training' be added to Section 5 'Policy, Imperative Training' (Elected and Appointed Members' Professional Development and Training Policy 2021).

Clause 41-21 above was carried 16 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Against:

Councillor Bruno Petrenas.

Moved Renee Dingwall, seconded Lorna Johnson.

6. That Section 5 'Policy, Desirable Training' (Elected and Appointed Members' Professional Development and Training Policy 2021) include the word 'cultural' in the following sentence: 'It may include, but not limited to community issues which address environmental, social, and economic

issues and challenges’.

Clause 41-21 above was carried 17 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Renee Dingwall, seconded Lorna Johnson.

7. That Section 4 ‘Expenses on Council Business (Elected Members), Meal Allowance’ (Elected and Appointed Members’ Expenses and Allowances Policy) include the words ‘unless needed for dietary requirements’ in the following sentence: ‘Separate meal costs will not be met where a meal has been provided as part of the training / conference / meeting, etc.’

Clause 41-21 above was carried 17 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

8. That Council will provide Elected Members with the option to claim a personal mobile plan connection with a Council-provided mobile phone.

Clause 41-21 above was carried 16 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Against:

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Brent Barrett.

Note:

On a motion: “That the words ‘Council will only pay for two beverages with an evening meal (alcoholic or non-alcoholic) eg. two glasses of wine / non-alcoholic beverage, two cans or small bottles of beer. Any drinks outside this guideline are to be met by the member’ be deleted and replaced with ‘Costs of alcohol are to be met by the member’”, the motion was lost 6 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew

Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Rachel Bowen.

Note:

On a motion: "That the words 'Council had a fixed budget for elected and appointed members' training, a 'first in, first served' approach is taken' be deleted and replaced with the words 'Previous attendance and training needs are considered, as well as an equitable distribution of available funding'", the motion was lost 8 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Zulfiqar Butt, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Rachel Bowen.

Note:

On a motion: "To add 'Conflict of interests will be managed – Elected Members wishing to attend a conference will not participate in decision making' (page 42 Elected and Appointed Members' Expenses and Allowances Policy and page 53 Elected and Appointed Members' Professional Development and Training Policy 2021)", the motion was lost 1 votes to 16, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillor Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Renee Dingwall.

Note:

On a motion: "That the definition of Council business include 'events attended in an official capacity'", the motion was lost 8 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

The meeting adjourned at 12.26pm.

The meeting resumed at 1.32pm.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillor Lew Findlay QSM were not present when the meeting resumed.

42-21 Victoria Esplanade Bonsai/Shade House Project Options
Report, presented by Kathy Dever-Tod, Parks and Reserves Manager.

During debate the recommendation was put in order that there be consideration for the proposal made in the Long Term Plan deliberations to complete the project.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) entered the meeting at 1.52pm.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Susan Baty.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That during Ten Year Plan deliberations, Council considers establishing a budget of \$880,000 in Year 2, dependant on external funding of \$150,000 for a Bonsai House and Shade House.

Clause 42-21 above was carried 10 votes to 6, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson and Karen Naylor.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Susan Baty.

Note:

On a motion: "That Council establishes an Esplanade Masterplan Project Steering Group (which involves Bonsai House and Aviaries refurbishment amongst other Masterplan projects)", the motion was tied 8 votes to 8. The chairperson declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Orphée Mickalad.

43-21 Committee Work Schedule

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Finance & Audit Committee receive its Work Schedule dated May 2021.

Clause 43-21 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC

44-21 Recommendation to Exclude Public

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting listed in the table below.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under Section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General subject of each matter to be considered		Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter	Ground(s) under Section 48(1) for passing this resolution
12.	Minutes of the Finance & Audit Committee meeting - Part II Confidential - 28 April 2021	For the reasons set out in the Finance & Audit Committee minutes of 28 April 2021, held in public present.	
13.	Award of Contract 3910 for Seismic Strengthening of the Turitea Water Treatment Plant	Commercial Activities and Negotiations	s7(2)(h) and s7(2)(i)

This resolution is made in reliance on Section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by Section 6 or Section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public as stated in the above table.

Clause 44-21 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas, Aleisha Rutherford and Mr Stephen Armstrong.

The public part of the meeting finished at 2.25pm

Confirmed 23 June 2021

Chairperson