

## APPENDIX A – SUMMARY OF ONLINE SUBMISSIONS

Around 2,600 public submissions were received on the online form available on the council website, for which a summary has been provided below.

### 1. Do you support the proposal to extend the parking hours to better manage demand?

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Yes	81	3.1%
No	2539	96.9%

#### If yes, why?

- *"I think it is really important to dis-incentivise car driving. We are in a climate and ecological crisis."*
- *"We need to discourage cars from the inner city. This is one way of doing this. At the same time the number of carparks should be reduced."*
- *"The city center is clogged with cars - both parked and moving. I support this as I hope it would encourage more people to think about a better method to get short distances."*
- *"Why should people park for free? As a rate payer I don't want to subsidise car owners. Cars are detrimental to a vibrant city life. Currently the whole PNCC approach is for a car dominant city. We can have a lovely city with less car dominance."*
- *"I own and manage a retail shop in Broadway Ave. Parking is an issue for my customers. The biggest users of the parks at night time and Sunday is the staff of other businesses. This makes it very hard for customers to get a carpark and get into my store."*

#### If no, why?

- *"Because everything is okay way it is, any change will effect local business and the way people shop, causing loss of income and a loss of hour's for the people that work at those places. For myself if I can't find a park around the CBD in a certain time frame I choose to park at places like the downtown car park and pay. I believe it should be a choice not a requirement after 5.30pm."*
- *"It's not a good way to encourage people to go into town. It's only Palmerston North, not a major city. There are also not decent alternatives to parking in town."*
- *"Extending paid parking hours just encourages people to go to the plaza paid parking - you pay at the end no time limits on enjoying your meal or movie. You say most people travel from outside the city to Palmerston North CBD - yes I'm one of those people but I'm a rate payer living in Ashhurst - why should I be penalized?"*
- *"It is still easy to find parking on the proposed hours. People come to town during these hours due to not having to pay for parking yet still being able to support local businesses."*

- *“You pay enough for parking as it is. Sunday parking should always be free. You can relax over lunch without worrying about parking meters. It will put a lot of people off coming to town and this will affect the small businesses.”*

**2. The proposal that Council is considering will extend the hours for paid parking until 9pm on Thursday night. Do you think is:**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Too long	2384	93.0%
Too short	19	0.7%
About right	160	6.2%

**If too long, why?**

- *“We want to encourage a lively feeling in the middle of town, with people coming in for food and entertainment. Paid parking at nighttime is a barrier to people wanting to do this. People coming in to enjoy themselves would end up calling nights early (and spending less money in local establishments which rely on people having a 3 course meal instead of a 1 course etc). Paid parking removes spontaneity from the experience. It also creates a safety concern if patrons are motivated to get their car out of the CBD, but have ended up drinking more than they intended. We want to encourage these people to leave their cars where they are, not be worried about Council fines. This parking proposal does not align to Palmy's ambition to be a foodie and cultural city or destination. I am especially opposed to this affecting business in the outer business zone in the district plan.”*
- *“This will discourage me from shopping in the town centre. Currently the charges enable me to still shop later when it is quieter or outside of my working hours and not incur additional costs. This will mean I am unable to afford to shop in town.”*
- *“The increase in hours for paid parking Thursday will penalise businesses offering entertainment and eating out, and will be very inconvenient for people parking for these evening attractions.”*

**If too short, why?**

- *“Keep our rates down as an offset to the money made from increased hours.”*
- *“I think people are abusing disabilities parks all night eg taxis and parking over driveways.”*
- *“Students go out and leave their vehicles in town. This makes it difficult for late night shoppers or early morning parkers to get a park when they need one”*

### **If about right, why?**

- *“Late night shopping is on a Thursday, so would agree this is the only night that makes sense to extend. Not ideal and charging more isn't always great, but if you must, this is the only one I support.”*
- *“Might move the pub goes a little better so you can actually get a park”*
- *“That seems fair. It will help manage demand around the restaurants. Increasing the amount of parking around the city centre will help as will having other options to get around and to and from Palmerston North quickly.”*

### **3. The proposal that Council is considering will extend the hours for paid parking until 9pm on Friday nights. Do you think is:**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Too long	2393	93.9%
Too short	22	0.9%
About right	134	5.3%

### **If too long, why?**

- *“Because everything is okay way it is, any chance will effect local business and the way people shop, causing loss of income and a loss of hour's for the people that work at those places. For myself if I can't find a park around the CBD in a certain time frame I choose to park at places like the downtown car park and pay. I believe it should be a choice not a requirement after 5.30pm.”*
- *“Keep the hours for paid parking to 5.30pm. People can then go the movies or restaurants/cafes without worrying about having to move their car part way through.”*
- *“The benefit of latenight shopping - or for most of us, the chance to shop after our working day has finished - is at least the ease of parking and that it is free!”*
- *“Having to leave dinner or a show/movie to top up parking or move a vehicle is not a good thing! Basically this seems to be another way for the council to revenue gather for their blown out budget”*
- *“Not needed. When you go out for the evening you don't want to bothered with feeding parking meters. Friday night is now more about people going out, or staying on after work , for a drink and to relax.”*
- *“I've never had an issue finding a park on a Friday night. The new hours are an unnecessary and annoying restriction.”*
- *“A blanket CBD wide charge for evening parking is too much. Maybe until 7pm on a Friday, and maybe around the square/broadway/main st area. I am aware parks are often full in the evenings and it can be difficult to find a park in these areas. I will sometimes pay to use the parking building at downtown however I see that that provides me with an extra layer of security from parking on the street which I am willing to pay for, compared to parking on main street which is often*

full of intoxicated people later in the evening when dinner or movies finish."

- "Most events held in the evening are longer than 2 hours eg shows and movies so it would be difficult to go and move your car or pay extra parking costs. There is also limited alternative options for transport at night eg buses. The other consideration is safety if you park in the free parking out of the main cbd and need to walk back to your car in the dark"

#### **If too short, why?**

- "If you are parking you should pay."
- "Targets the restaurant goers but not the pub goers? That are usually longer. This would be the only day I agree parking needs a little help along."
- "It puts me off going into town for dinner, it's hard to judge how long dinner will be so you would have to go out to top up the metre or cut dinner short. It is anti social. I don't see any current problems with current hours"
- "I work late in the CBD with no parking except for on a Main Street, and parking there for free after 5:30 has always been beneficial as the security guard can watch our vehicles. Requiring us to pay will make it even more expensive for us which is an unnecessary cost."
- "It is a joke, the reason people go out later at night and on weekends is because of free parking. Doing this will stop that"

#### **If about right, why?**

- "Parking management is good but only if the fees are low enough to not put people off visiting the centre during the evening, it is unlikely people will use other modes to get to town during cold/dark months once the bus becomes irregular."
- "Like I said said in the other ones! The days that mainly have a high demand for parking I think this would be good! Personally I find Thursday, Friday Saturday the most packed"
- "Carparks free up after around 9pm anyway, anything later than that is unnecessary, earlier and it won't help."
- "Workers who want to celebrate after work are more likely to be able to afford the extra expense"
- "I agree with this as long as you leave weekends alone. Give people a choice."

#### **4. The proposal that Council is considering will extend the hours for paid parking to be between 9am and 9pm on Saturdays. Do you think is:**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Too long	2427	95.8%
Too short	18	0.7%
About right	89	3.5%

### **If too long, why?**

- *"Saturdays maybe till 5pm but after that then you are going to penalise a lot of people who want to come into a show whether it be at the globe, or regent"*
- *"I'm not too worried about parking starting at 9am (again 11am is better), but again you are making it an issue for locals heading out on Saturday afternoon and evening to spend at our local businesses."*
- *"Would be less likely to use cbd - we already pay for Plaza but at least that comes with added security and it's indoors. What are we actually paying for??"*
- *"Why, why, why do you want to stop people from enjoying special events in the Square when they have to worry about their parking? Families spend lots of time in the central city in the weekends and it is not easy wrangling the kids without the added worry of curtailing time at an event to get back to the car. With the type of parking we have here, once our parking time runs out we have to move our car to another park. Can you imagine families doing this, or older people doing this, or disabled people doing this? You are thinking with short-sightedness. Just think about the wider community and how extended hours will affect ALL groups."*
- *"Same as the above. It HUGELY decreases safety, and discriminates against people with low incomes to be able to enjoy Palmerston North."*
- *"11-3 is appropriate. This is the main shopping time. Evening parking fees will affect small business in the area. I would reconsider using the city centre in the evening if I had to pay parking then."*
- *"This is abominable. I would go to Fielding instead. From my house it is about the same distance to Feilding as to the centre of town. And you'll really put visitors off."*
- *"Saturday is not a business working day, why charge parking for that long. This is Palmerston North not Wellington."*
- *"Give us a bit of a break! We live here because it's not a big city with big city charges and lifestyle creep. There's a much better ways to use the money we pay in rates and cover the costs of whatever you are trying to get money for"*

### **If too short, why?**

- *"User should pay"*
- *"I think the parking hours should be consistent throughout the whole week, this makes it easy to remember."*
- *"I think people are abusing disabilities parks all night eg taxis and parking over driveways."*

### **If about right, why?**

- *"Seems to match my experience of when parking is in short supply"*
- *"There is a lot of demand on Saturdays so would be good to manage that"*

- *“Paid parking is already 11-3, and I would agree with the change from 9 to 9 on Saturday, as long as there is free parking on Sunday. Shoppers can either take public transport, get dropped off, or pay for parks. Diners and theatre goers should only have to pay for 3 hour parking at the most.”*
- *“It is hard to find a park when you need one currently and businesses are missing out as a result. Making parking more of a user pays system is fairer as it puts driving on par with other forms of transport and encourages people to think about how they travel. Currently, while parking enforcement may or may not pay for itself in the council budget, the infrastructure investment required to build and maintain parking spaces across the city is essentially given to drivers for free by ratepayers, some of whom drive and some of whom don't. It's not very fair for people who don't drive to be contributing to this.”*
- *“Saturdays are notoriously busy and majority of people are out to eat and look. Perhaps an hour free and then paid would still be encouraging but allow for better turnover.”*

**5. Council is also considering introducing paid parking on Sundays from 9am to 3pm. Do you think this is:**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Too long	2349	93.8%
Too short	33	1.3%
About right	123	4.9%

**If too long, why?**

- *“I mostly go into town on Sundays when (and because) it's free parking. If parking charges come in on Sundays I will shop online instead and not support local businesses. If I have to go in I will no longer wander the shops or stop at a cafe (where I often make purchases).  
I must note - parking on Sundays is never difficult in the CBD which indicates there is not a demand issue to solve, and this looks like a cash grab by the Council at the expense of local business.”*
- *“Sunday parking should remain free. Most residents and CBD retailers want Palmerston North to be a welcoming, vibrant, and thriving city, and thus to provide free parking on one day per week is one way to help accomplish this wise philosophy. There is no need for any 'better management' of car parking on Sundays. Furthermore, imposing extensions to car park charges does nothing to address the city's carbon footprint. In fact, to increase parking hours could very easily increase the city's carbon footprint. Commonsense should prevail here. Yes, commonsense is a rare commodity these days (i.e. not very common), I realise that, but this really is a no-brainer.”*
- *“Palmerston North competes with visitor-friendly towns like Feilding and Whanganui - people already chose to go these towns because of the*

parking cost in Palmerston North. It makes Palmerston North too quiet and unattractive. It compromises safety."

- "Parking should be free on Sunday non stop. We live in Palmerston North, not Wellington, not Auckland and realistically it's not that difficult to find a park on a Sunday. Streets within 500m walking distance to town or George Street with paid parking are virtually empty, or perhaps have one or two cars. Definitely no need to solve an issue of demand as it's rarely a problem."

**If too short, why?**

- "If you are parking you should pay as parking space is not free for the Council to provide or maintain."
- "If the parking hours were consistent throughout the week, changed to current Monday hours, then Sunday would generate revenue for the council and the public would always be able to remember what the parking hours are as they never change."
- "We need more money."

**If about right, why?**

- "Church goers take up all the parking. They bring no financial benefit into the areas they attend church and instead choose to donate their often limited funds to a church already doing just fine having paid zero tax"
- "It is hard to find a park when you need one currently and businesses are missing out as a result. Making parking more of a user pays system is fairer as it puts driving on par with other forms of transport and encourages people to think about how they travel. Currently, while parking enforcement may or may not pay for itself in the council budget, the infrastructure investment required to build and maintain parking spaces across the city is essentially given to drivers for free by ratepayers, some of whom drive and some of whom don't. It's not very fair for people who don't drive to be contributing to this."
- "It is probably fair to have paid parking on a Sunday. It is essentially just another working day in this day and age and I feel this would be a good compromise to have paid parking end at 5 30pm on a Thurs, Fri and Sat."

**6. Do you regularly park in on-street carparks in the city centre on Thursday, Friday or Saturday evenings, or on Sundays?**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Yes	1958	75.8%
No	626	24.2%

**a. If yes, how easy is it for you to find a carpark?**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Very easy	285	14.6%
Easy	1153	58.9%
Difficult	439	22.4%
Very difficult	81	4.1%

**b. If no, why?**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
No reason to go to the city centre at that time	335	50.9%
Difficult to find a carpark near my destination	82	12.5%
Other	241	36.6%

**If no and other, specify?**

- "I use the nearest free parking and walk to my destination."
- "I refuse to pay for parking so go to places where I dont have to pay. Especially with never having change on me and if the credit card option is working (which it often isnt) you get charged an extra \$1.50 just to use it. Rip off"
- "I dont go into the square because i cant afford to go shopping"
- "Why don't you have an option for this?!! I bike or walk."
- "Not a regular option for myself or family. It is difficult to find parking when I do and often if by myself not a safe feeling having to use the alleys to commute from parks to places."
- "Try to bike as often as possible. If I can't find a park, it's not difficult to walk from a further away park (if I leave home early enough). Would travel by bus if there was a service available at night."
- "Live in Feilding where the parking is free ❤️"

**7. Do you think the cost to Council of maintaining on-street carparks should be covered by rates or by the user of the carpark?**

Answer	Number of responses	Percentage of responses
Rates	1340	56.3%
Users	1041	43.7%



## 8. Do you have any other feedback about our proposal?

- "We think no one is going to want to pay for parking but it is not realistic or fair that ratepayers should pay. Car parking is an ineffective and expensive use of space especially with people/cities wanting and needing more space for housing and businesses as well as social space. The council should be leading the change to a eco-sustainable city and actively discouraging people parking within the CBD would be a start. Also removing on street parking. If businesses feel they really need car parking they should be providing these onsite."
- "I would MUCH prefer an increase in the cost per hour to park, DURING the CURRENT paid parking hours: Eg. Would rather pay \$2 or \$2.50 p/h to park during week days in on street paid parking, and NOT charge for late night parking. Or cover the fees in rates and council budgets, as the council has plenty of funding spent unnecessarily in other areas. Free parking in late nights is an absolute ESSENTIAL for keeping Palmerston North safe."
- "\$2.00 INcrease hrly rate but dont change times"
- "Why change something that works !!!"
- "The overall goal of City Council is to provide good supporting environment for the residents and business. Any fee and charge review should be considered with the same objective. Cost is only one of the factors to be considered. The World Bank has done a lot of research on fees and charges. I think the Council should have a better understanding on how to use fees and charges policies to achieved the overall goal of the City Council."
- "People pay rates to live in the town of their choice, part of the culture of that town is the "downtown/CBD". It is part of the cost of living in a town. This proposal appears to be a pointless money grab which will detrimentally affect the culture of Palmie. The rising housing costs are already harming what made Palmie such a great place to live, don't remove something that makes the town still a friendly and welcoming place to live."
- "Reduce amount of all day parking. Add extra short term (15 min) parking around Broadway and other high traffic areas with fast food establishments. Trial free parking with shorter time limits"
- "There isn't enough free parks for the workers, charging them to park their cars while they work is absurd! Keep them free on sundays and after 5! Because I honestly wait till Sunday to do town things because of the free parking!"
- "You have already increased the rates . why would you do it again just to cover parking cost. I would like to see what approaches other cities have taken to manage their problem. May be more public transport and motivation to use it. Free public transport to wider groups such as Health Staff, Council and CBD business staff (such as banks and retails) so that they don't have to bring the cars to the CBD for work."
- "Am happy with the status quo of parking thanks"
- "Yes , doesn't nzta cover the parking spot costs ?"
- "Yes. Increasing rates every year is a straight out rort. Putting rates up to cover wastage in council spending is not on. People's incomes are not keeping up with the unnecessary spending. Live within your means the same as every citizen has to do."

- "Yes! The square parking is the worst place to park due to the birds crapping and the trees being directly above the car parks! I always notice those parks aren't being used! & There's only a high demand for parks because there not enough parks! So there is quite a bit of space constantly not being used because people dont want to have bird poo all over there car so looking into maybe putting something in the trees to catch that or creating some sort of shelter just over the parks to protect people from being crapped on when getting out of there cars! It'll just open a more space up in those areas! I'm not sure about the work parking but I can see down broad way it almost looks like theres no where down Broadway for them to park so maybe looking into that for them would be good!"
- "Depending on time of day some days/nights are easy to find a park other days can be difficult but that depends on how far you wish to walk to your destination. All I am asking is provide us with a better bus system that gives us the chance to catch buses into town after 7:00pm to do shopping and go out and about in restaurants etc... I am a rate payer and find it really hard to get into town after heading home from work and then trying to get back into town for social events and expeditions that maybe on at the square. George st, Regent etc.. Not everyone wants to catch taxis as they too are expensive."
- "what makes you think people would want to spend extra money to park ?? Yes, the town is growing but this town is boring...maybe you should spend more time in making Palmy more interesting, make people want to go out more, before you try squeezing ratepayers pockets for no reason."
- "The council had no sense and used all that money on awful coloured blocks on Pioneer Highway. If you are willing to waste money in this way, you should not punish the people who want to go into town and support local businesses. If the council can't afford to upkeep the inner city car parks with the money they are currently getting from the current hours, then I would suggest you stop wasting it in other places first and get some sort of business sense; before you go and make the ratepayers pay even more for parking in town"
- "Payment mixed rates and users."
- "Encourage people to get into town another way, rather than discouraging them from travelling the only way possible currently!"
- "I think your proposal mostly makes sense and I was glad to hear you made it. I was disappointed that there was so much blind hate about it on Facebook without people considering why we might need these extended hours. Unfortunately Facebook has all the negative nancies and I don't actually think it's an accurate representation of all Palmerston North people's opinion. The main pain point for me with parking is that it is so hard to get a park near the restaurants on Broadway. If bringing in paying for parking there at dinner time helps the issue then I will be happy and I really don't mind paying a few dollars."
- "If you want to promote turnover, apply a 3 hour limit. That would give people enough time to shop but still promote a healthy turnover of parks."
- "I and many other people who contribute to this city in the performing arts sector will be incredibly disappointed should any proposed changes to pid parking hours go ahead. Although there may be legislation that suggests the council does not have to consult the public on this decision, it

*was incredibly disappointing that they didn't due to the scope of this decision and the amount of people it impacts greatly. Also, the timing of this announcement (where you have stated you will raise up to \$500,000 alongside the decision to pay a living wage to council workers (\$300,000) was disgusting, as this seems a clear ploy to raise the additional money required to pay this wage. It is sad to see the council celebrate the fact that they will pay staff a living wage directly after informing the public of the drastic parking changes. The council were elected to represent the people, not rob them. Parking hour changes should clearly not go ahead."*

- *"Also, on Sundays I find it easy to get parks in town by George Street and that side of the square. In the evenings on Broadway it can be busier but a couple of laps and something will usually turn up and it seems to move relatively quickly or on Regent show nights you can usually get one in the square car park or on Queen or King Street."*
- *"As above. Thinking of now shopping in Feilding as they have free car parks and no limits at night. The business owners will pay in the end. Give us all a break. You are putting up the rates so leave the parking alone!!!"*