



**PAPAIOEA  
PALMERSTON  
NORTH  
CITY**

---

# **PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL**

---

AGENDA

## **COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL**

---

**TUESDAY 10 MAY 2022 AT 9.00AM, 3.30PM AND 7.00PM  
THURSDAY 12 MAY 2022 AT 9.00AM, 3.30PM AND 7.00PM  
FRIDAY 13 MAY 2022 AT 3.30PM  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, FIRST FLOOR, CIVIC ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
32 THE SQUARE, PALMERSTON NORTH**

---

# MEMBERS

---

<b>Grant Smith (Chairperson)</b>	
<b>Aleisha Rutherford (Deputy Chairperson)</b>	
<b>Brent Barrett</b>	<b>Patrick Handcock ONZM</b>
<b>Susan Baty</b>	<b>Leonie Hapeta</b>
<b>Rachel Bowen</b>	<b>Lorna Johnson</b>
<b>Zulfiqar Butt</b>	<b>Billy Meehan</b>
<b>Vaughan Dennison</b>	<b>Orphée Mickalad</b>
<b>Renee Dingwall</b>	<b>Karen Naylor</b>
<b>Lew Findlay QSM</b>	<b>Bruno Petrenas</b>

AGENDA ITEMS, IF NOT ATTACHED, CAN BE VIEWED AT

[pncc.govt.nz](http://pncc.govt.nz) | Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square  
City Library | Ashhurst Community Library | Linton Library

---

**Chris Dyhrberg**

**Acting Chief Executive | PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL**

---

Te Mārae o Hine | 32 The Square  
Private Bag 11034 | Palmerston North 4442 | New Zealand  
[pncc.govt.nz](http://pncc.govt.nz)

**PALMY**™  
PAPAIOEA  
PALMERSTON  
NORTH  
CITY

## **COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL MEETING**

### **Hearing of Submissions Annual Budget 2022/23**

Tuesday 10 May 2022 at 9.00am, 3.30pm and 7.00pm

Thursday 12 May 2022 at 9.00am, 3.30pm and 7.00pm

Friday 13 May 2022 at 3.30pm

#### **Notes:**

1. Submissions have previously been circulated to Elected Members.
2. Copies of all submissions are available for public perusal at [pncc.govt.nz \(https://www.pncc.govt.nz/Participate-Palmy/Have-your-say/Draft-Annual-Budget-2022-23\)](https://www.pncc.govt.nz/Participate-Palmy/Have-your-say/Draft-Annual-Budget-2022-23), at the Customer Service Centre, the City Library, and at the hearings.
3. Tea and coffee will be available in the Linkspan prior to and during the hearings.

## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### **1. Apologies**

### **2. Notification of Additional Items**

Pursuant to Sections 46A(7) and 46A(7A) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987, to receive the Chairperson's explanation that specified item(s), which do not appear on the Agenda of this meeting and/or the meeting to be held with the public excluded, will be discussed.

Any additions in accordance with Section 46A(7) must be approved by resolution with an explanation as to why they cannot be delayed until a future meeting.

Any additions in accordance with Section 46A(7A) may be received or referred to a subsequent meeting for further discussion. No resolution, decision or recommendation can be made in respect of a minor item.

**3. Declarations of Interest (if any)**

Members are reminded of their duty to give a general notice of any interest of items to be considered on this agenda and the need to declare these interests.

**4. Confirmation of Minutes**

Page 7

"That the minutes of the Committee of Council meeting of 23 June 2021 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record."

**5. Confirmation of Minutes**

Page 11

"That the minutes of the extraordinary Committee of Council meeting of 2 March 2022 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record."

**6. Appointment of Chairs for following sessions**

**7. Extension of meeting time**

**8. Hearing of Submissions**

Page 23

Submissions have been circulated under separate cover.

**9. Exclusion of Public**

To be moved:

"That the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting listed in the table below.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each

matter, and the specific grounds under Section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General subject of each matter to be considered	Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter	Ground(s) under Section 48(1) for passing this resolution

This resolution is made in reliance on Section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by Section 6 or Section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public as stated in the above table.

Also that the persons listed below be permitted to remain after the public has been excluded for the reasons stated.

*[Add Third Parties]*, because of their knowledge and ability to assist the meeting in speaking to their report/s [or other matters as specified] and answering questions, noting that such person/s will be present at the meeting only for the items that relate to their respective report/s [or matters as specified].



## PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the Committee of Council Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 23 June 2021, commencing at 1.03pm**

**Members Present:** Grant Smith (The Mayor) (in the Chair) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Apologies:** Councillor Orphée Mickalad (absent on Council business).

Councillor Orphée Mickalad entered the meeting at 1.47pm during consideration of clause 35. He was not present for clauses 32 to 34 inclusive.

### **32-21 Apologies**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 32-21 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

### **33-21 Confirmation of Minutes**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the Committee of Council meeting of 9 June 2021 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record, as amended.

Clause 33-21 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

### **34-21 Adoption of Council strategic direction**

Memorandum, presented by David Murphy, Chief Planning Officer and Julie Macdonald, Strategy and Policy Manager.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

#### The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the strategies and plans listed below and attached to the memorandum titled 'Adoption of Council strategic direction', presented to the Committee of Council on 23 June 2021, are adopted as the strategic direction underpinning the 2021-31 10-Year plan:

Te rautaki tāone auaha, tāone tiputipu – Innovative and growing city strategy

Te whakatipu tāone – City growth plan

Te whakawhanake ōhanga – Economic development plan

Ngā aranukunuku – Transport plan

Te tāone whakaihihi, tapatapahi ana – Creative and liveable city strategy

Te hapori hohe – Active communities plan

Te toi me te taonga tuku iho – Arts and heritage plan

Te ahuahu tāone – City shaping plan

Te rautaki hapori tūhonohono – Connected communities strategy

Te hapori tūhonohono – Connected communities plan

Te hapori haumarū – Safe communities plan

He rautaki tāone tautaiāo – Eco city strategy

Te āhuarangi hurihuri – Climate change plan

Te taiāo toitū – Environmental sustainability plan

Te Awa o Manawatū – Manawatū River plan

Te whakaaraara rawa – Resource recovery plan

Ngā wai – Waters plan

Te mana urungi papai tonu me te kirirautanga hohe – Governance and active citizenship plan

2. That the City Spatial Plan, attached to the memorandum titled 'Adoption of Council strategic direction', presented to the Committee of Council on 23 June 2021, is adopted.

#### The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

3. That the strategies and plans attached to the memorandum titled 'Adoption of Council strategic direction', presented to the Committee of Council on 23 June 2021, replace the strategic framework adopted by Council on 11 June 2018.



4. That the executive summaries of the Asset Management Plans, listed below and attached to the memorandum titled 'Adoption of Council strategic direction', presented to the Committee of Council on 23 June 2021', are received:

AMP Parks and reserves

AMP Property

AMP Resource recovery

AMP Stormwater

AMP Transport

AMP Wastewater

AMP Water

5. That any minor amendments are able to be made to the attached documents prior to publication with the agreement of the Mayor and Deputy Mayor.

Clause 34-21 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**35-21**

**Approving the 2021-31 10-Year Plan (Long-term Plan) for Audit**

Memorandum, presented by David Murphy, Chief Planning Officer and Stuart McKinnon, Chief Financial Officer.

Councillor Orphée Mickalad entered the meeting at 1.47pm.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

**The COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the 2021 Revenue and Financing Policy, as shown in the draft of the 10-Year Plan (Long-term Plan) (separately attached as Appendix 2), be adopted.
2. That the 2021 Development Contributions Policy (separately attached as Appendix 3) be adopted, as amended.
3. That the 2021 Significance and Engagement Policy (separately attached as Appendix 4) be adopted.

**The COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

4. That any minor amendments are able to be made to the attached documents prior to publication with the agreement of the Mayor and Deputy Mayor.

Clause 35-21 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

5. That the 2021-31 10-Year Plan (Long-term Plan) (separately attached as Appendix 1) be referred to Audit New Zealand and presented to Council on 7 July 2021 for approval.

Clause 35-21 above was carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

Councillor Karen Naylor.

The meeting finished at 1.59pm

Confirmed

**Chairperson**

## **PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the Extraordinary Committee of Council Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 02 March 2022, commencing at 1.03pm.**

**Members Present:** The Mayor (Grant Smith) (in the Chair) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Brent Barrett left the meeting at 10.30am at the conclusion of clause 1.4. He entered the meeting again when the meeting resumed at 11.46am. He was not present for clauses 1.5 to 1.7 inclusive.

Councillor Bruno Petrenas left the meeting at 12.34pm during consideration of clause 1.8. He entered the meeting again at 12.39pm during consideration of clause 1.9. He was not present for clause 1.8.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 3.35pm during consideration of clause 2.1. She entered the meeting again at 3.45pm at the conclusion of clause 2.1. She left the meeting again at 4.06pm during consideration of clause 3. She was not present for clauses 2.1 and 3.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta left the meeting at 4.06pm during consideration of clause 3. She was not present for clause 3.

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed at 4.20pm. He was not present for clause 3.

Councillor Lew Findlay left the meeting at 4.34pm during consideration of clause 3. He was not present for clause 3.

#### **1-22 Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 - Adopting Supporting Information and the Consultation Document**

Memorandum, presented by Cameron McKay, Acting Chief Financial Officer and Steve Paterson, Strategy Manager - Finance.

#### **Schedules A and B: Carry Forwards and Deferrals of Capital Programmes**

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Chief Executive incorporate the assumptions regarding carry forwards of capital programmes from the 2021/22 year as detailed in Schedule A in the draft of the 2022/23 Annual Budget.
2. That the Chief Executive incorporate the deferrals of capital programmes from 2022/23 to later years as detailed in Schedule B.

Clauses 1.1-22 and 1.2-22 above were carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

Councillor Zulfiqar Butt.

The meeting adjourned at 3.03pm.

The meeting resumed on 3 March 2022 at 10.07am.

**Schedule C: Variations to Operating Programmes**

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That a budget of \$65,000 be allocated to programme 2129 to undertake a trial of a free rubbish bag a month to low income households.

Clause 1.3-22 above was carried 10 votes to 6, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Lorna Johnson and Billy Meehan.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

4. That the following proposed new Operational programme is removed from the draft 22/23 Annual Budget, and is included in a list titled: "Considered but not included":

- Programme 2136 – City Marketing Campaigns - \$150,000

Clause 1.4-22 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Brent Barrett left the meeting at 10.30am.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

5. That the following proposed Operational programme is removed:

- Programme 2135 - \$21,000 – LGNZ Conference

Clause 1.5-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

6. That an additional budget of \$100,000 is allocated to continue that COVID-19 Relief Fund for 2022/23.

Clause 1.6-22 above was carried 12 votes to 2, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

Councillors Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Abstained:**

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

7. That the Chief Executive incorporate the variations to operating programmes as detailed in Schedule C in the draft 2022/23 Annual Budget, subject to the resolutions 3 to 6 above.

Clause 1.7-22 above was carried 14 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

Councillor Karen Naylor.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following proposed new Operational programme is removed from the draft 22/23 Annual Budget, and is included in a list titled: 'Considered but not included': Prog 2129 – Free rubbish bag per month to low income households - \$165k. The motion was lost 5 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following proposed operational programme is removed: Prog 2133 – Health and Safety Improvement Programme - \$1,000k – That the proposed Health and Safety Improvement Programme is reviewed and that priority actions are delivered through existing capability, through reprioritising work. The motion was lost 7 votes to 8, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Zulfiqar Butt, Lew Findlay QSM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Abstained:**

Councillor Rachel Bowen.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

**Note:**

On a motion that programme 2133 – Health and Safety Improvement Programme - \$500k in year 2 and \$500k in year 3. The motion was lost 6 votes to 8, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Lew Findlay QSM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Abstained:**

Councillor Rachel Bowen.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following programme's funding is reduced: Prog 2139 - \$200k – (op) Additional budget to deliver residential and industrial growth planning – reduce to \$100k. The motion was lost 0 votes to 15, the voting being as follows:

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

**Note:**

On a motion that programme 1506 – Community Events be adjusted to \$544,000. The motion was lost 5 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

The meeting adjourned at 11.21am.

The meeting resumed at 11.46am.

Councillor Brent Barrett was present when the meeting resumed.

### **Schedule G: Operating Income and Expenses**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

8. That the Chief Executive incorporate the changes to assumptions and operating income and expenses as summarised in Schedule G in the draft of the 2022/23 Annual Budget.

Councillor Bruno Petrenas left the meeting at 12.34pm.

Clause 1.8-22 above was carried 13 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

Councillors Billy Meehan and Karen Naylor.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

**Note:**

On a motion that the proposed additional budget for employee remuneration be reduced by \$2,000k to enable \$4,792k additional for the 22/23 year. That the application/prioritisation of the additional \$4,792k remuneration to be determined by the Chief Executive (note: this would enable a 9.2% increase to the employee remuneration budget, as compared to the 21/22 budget). The motion was lost 6 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

### ***Schedules D and E: Capital Renewal Programme and Capital New Programme***

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

9. That the following proposed Capital New programme is added to the draft 22/23 Annual Budget:
  - \$300,000 for on-demand crossing Ferguson/Linton Street.

Councillor Bruno Petrenas entered the meeting again at 12.39pm.

Clause 1.9-22 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

**Against:**

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.



Moved Grant Smith, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

10. That the Chief Executive incorporate the variations to capital renewal programmes as detailed in Schedule D in the draft of the 2022/23 Annual Budget.
11. That the Chief Executive incorporate the variations to capital new programmes as detailed in Schedule E in the draft of the 2022/23 Annual Budget, including resolution 9 above.

Clauses 1.10-22 and 1.11-22 above were carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Karen Naylor.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following proposed Capital New programme is removed from the draft 22/23 Annual Budget, and is included in a list titled: 'considered but not included': Prog 167 – James Line Improvements - \$1,443k. The motion was lost 5 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following proposed Capital New Programme is removed from the draft 22/23 Annual Budget, and is included in a list titled 'considered by not included': Prog 1676 – additional funding to improve participation in council meetings - \$150k. The motion was lost 7 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Rachel Bowen, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson and

Aleisha Rutherford.

The meeting adjourned at 1.15pm.

The meeting resumed at 2.18pm.

### **Schedule F: Programmes with no proposed change**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

#### **The COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

12. That the following programme's funding is reduced:

- Programme 86 - \$103,000 – (capital renewal) Furniture replacements – reduce to \$50,000.

Clause 1.12-22 above was carried 11 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

#### **Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

#### **The COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

13. That the following programme's funding is reduced:

- Programme 2047 - \$154,000 – (capital new) Furniture transformation – reduce to \$75,000.

Clause 1.13-22 above was carried 11 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

#### **Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Brent Barrett.

#### **The COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

14. That the Chief Executive incorporate the programmes with no proposed change to the budget shown in year 2 of the 10 year Plan as detailed in Schedule F in the draft of the 2022/23 Annual Budget, incorporating resolutions 12 and 13 above.

Clause 1.14-22 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following programme's funding is reduced: Prog 1826 - \$308k – (capital new) CAB Workplace Transformation – reduce to \$150k. The motion was lost 7 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following programme is deferred to FY 2023/24: Prog 2044 - \$197k (op) Kerbside Food waste – Investigations and Trial – defer to 23/24. The motion was lost 6 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following operational programme is reduced: Prog 1929 - \$256k – (op) – Workforce Transformation – reduce to \$125k. The motion was lost 7 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

**Note:**

On a motion that the following operational programme is removed: Prog 1936 - \$30k – (op) Funding for Section 17a review. The motion was lost 3 votes to 13, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

**2-22**

**Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 - Adopting Supporting Information and the Consultation Document**

Memorandum, presented by Cameron McKay, Acting Chief Financial Officer and Steve Paterson, Strategy Manager - Finance.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 3.35pm.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Susan Baty.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the uniform annual general charge be modelled at \$200, \$100 and \$0 and reported to Council on 16 March 2022.

Clause 2.1-22 above was carried 14 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

**Against:**

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford entered the meeting again at 3.45pm.

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That the draft annual budget include an assumption the differentials for the general rate will be modified as outlined in Table 1 of the report and that the uniform annual general charge will be \$300.

Clause 2.2-22 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM,

Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

**3-22**

**Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 - Adopting Supporting Information and the Consultation Document**

Memorandum, presented by Cameron McKay, Acting Chief Financial Officer and Steve Paterson, Strategy Manager - Finance.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting again at 4.06pm.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta left the meeting at 4.06pm.

The meeting adjourned at 4.07pm.

The meeting resumed at 4.20pm.

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed.

Councillor Lew Findlay left the meeting at 4.34pm.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Chief Executive incorporate the outcomes from recommendation 1 into the updated versions of the supporting information and consultation document to be presented for adoption at the Council meeting on 16 March 2022.

Clause 3-22 above was carried 9 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Moved Renee Dingwall, seconded Brent Barrett.

**Note:**

On a motion to include in the Consultation Document information and questions to gain community feedback on whether reference group members, advisory group members, and youth council members should be offered koha, paid meeting fees and/or reimbursements of expenses. The motion was lost 3 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Renee Dingwall and Lorna Johnson.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

The meeting finished at 5.02pm.

Confirmed 10 May 2022

**Chairperson**

## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

**Tuesday 10 May 2022**

### SESSION 1

**TIME & DATE:** 9.00am - 11.00am, Tuesday 10 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** The Mayor (Grant Smith) (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE ADMINISTRATOR:** Natalya Kushnirenko, telephone (06) 356 8199

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
9.00am - 10.00am	1	Aniz	10
	54	Nicola Larsen	10
	83	Steve Stannard	10
	122	James Russell	10
	130	Paul Perry	10
10.00am - 11.00am	173	Water Safety New Zealand - Dan Gerrard	10
	266	Emma Ochei	10
	269	Bruce Duncan	10
			10
			10

## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

Tuesday 10 May 2022

### SESSION 2

**TIME & DATE:** 3.30pm – 5.30pm, Tuesday 10 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** Councillor Patrick Handock (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE** Rosa de Souza, telephone (06) 356 8199

**ADMINISTRATOR:**

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
3.30pm	51	Michelle O'Brien	10
-	61	Lindsay Gray	10
4.30pm	285	Disability Reference Group – Nick Dow	10
	306	Te Hā o Hine-ahu-one Palmerston North Women's Health Collective – Jean Hera	10
	325	Environment Network Manawatū – Stewart Harrex	10
4.30pm	310	Richard Bedford	10
-			10
5.30pm			10
			10
			10



## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

**Tuesday 10 May 2022**

### SESSION 3

**TIME & DATE:** 7.00pm – 9.00pm, Tuesday 10 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** Councillor Zulfiqar Butt (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE** Rosa de Souza, telephone (06) 356 8199

**ADMINISTRATOR:**

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
7.00pm	24	Sheridan O'Hara	10
-	31	Andrea Molony	10
8:00pm	39	Josh Stewart	10
	48	Andrew Wellwood	10
	123	Duniz Gultekin	10
8.00pm	181	Martia Alico	10
-	252	Stephanie Hedges	10
9:00pm	334	Amanda Borren-Lean	10
			10
			10

## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

Thursday 12 May 2022

### SESSION 4

**TIME & DATE:** 9.00am – 11.00am, Thursday 12 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** Councillor Karen Naylor (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE** Rosa de Souza, telephone (06) 356 8199

**ADMINISTRATOR:**

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
9.00am - 10.00am	126	Ngati Hineaute Hapu Authority - Christopher Whaiapu	10
	129	Tony Passman	10
	197	River Stop Awapuni - David Chapple & Annette Nixon	10
	293	Awapuni Park Community and Recreation Centre (aka Awapuni Community Centre) – Norelle Ward	10
	324	Boho Café - Jeanine Gribbin	10
10.00am - 11.00am	326	Environment Network Manawatū- the Manawatū Food Action Network – Madz BatachEl	10
	340	Malcolm Frith	10
			10
			10
			10

## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

**Thursday 12 May 2022**

### SESSION 5

**TIME & DATE:** 3.30pm – 5.30pm, Thursday 12 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** Councillor Bruno Petrenas (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE** Carly Chang, telephone (06) 356 8199

**ADMINISTRATOR:**

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
3.30pm	90	Mike Clement	10
-	104	Malcolm Prince	10
4.30pm	207	Richard Wilde	10
	287	Palmerston North Youth Council - Caragh Aspden	10
	298	Memorial Park Sports Trust Board – Sandi Nimmo	10
4.30pm			10
-			10
5.30pm			10
			10
			10

## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

Thursday 12 May 2022

### SESSION 6

**TIME & DATE:** 7.00pm – 9.00pm, Thursday 12 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** Councillor Renee Dingwall (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE** Carly Chang, telephone (06) 356 8199

**ADMINISTRATOR:**

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
7.00pm	174	Rod Pik	10
-	316	Steve Allan	10
8:00pm	335	Ava Reidy	10
	209	Amer Jaffal	10
			10
8.00pm			10
-			10
9:00pm			10
			10
			10

## ANNUAL BUDGET 2022-23

### Friday 13 May 2022

#### SESSION 7

**TIME & DATE:** 3.30pm – 5.30pm, Friday 13 May 2022

**MEMBERS:** Deputy Mayor Aleisha Rutherford (Chair), and Councillors

**DEMOCRACY & GOVERNANCE** Natalya Kushnirenko, telephone (06) 356 8199

**ADMINISTRATOR:**

Time:	Submission No:	Submitter	Minutes
3.30pm	82	Ben Marshall	10
-	296	Robert Dabb	10
4.30pm	319	Central Palmerston North Business Improvement District Inc. (Palmy BID) - Rob Campbell (Chair) & Amanda Linsley (MBC)	10
	336	Manawatū Business Chamber - Amanda Linsley	10
	314	Dale O'Reilly	10
4.30pm			10
-			10
5.30pm			10
			10
			10