



PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

AGENDA
EXTRAORDINARY
COUNCIL

2PM, MONDAY 2 OCTOBER 2017
COUNCIL CHAMBER, FIRST FLOOR, CIVIC ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
32 THE SQUARE, PALMERSTON NORTH



MEMBERSHIP

Grant Smith (Mayor)

Tangi Utikere (Deputy Mayor)

Brent Barrett

Susan Baty

Rachel Bowen

Adrian Broad

Gabrielle Bundy-Cooke

Vaughan Dennison

Lew Findlay QSM

Leonie Hapeta

Jim Jefferies

Lorna Johnson

Duncan McCann

Karen Naylor

Bruno Petrenas

Aleisha Rutherford

Agenda items, if not attached, can be viewed at:

pncc.govt.nz | Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square
City Library | Ashhurst Community Library | Linton Library

Heather Shotter

Chief Executive, Palmerston North City Council

Palmerston North City Council

W pncc.govt.nz | E info@pncc.govt.nz | P 356 8199

Private Bag 11034, 32 The Square, Palmerston North



EXTRAORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING

2 October 2017

MEETING NOTICE

Pursuant to Clause 21 of Schedule 7 of the Local Government Act 2002, I hereby requisition an extraordinary meeting of the Council to be held at 2.00pm on Monday, 2 October 2017 in the Council Chamber, first floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North, to consider the business stated below.



MAYOR

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Apologies

2. Confirmation of Agenda and Urgent items

Pursuant to Sections 46A(7) and 46A(7A) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987, to receive the Chairperson's explanation that specified item(s), which do not appear on the Agenda of this meeting and/or the meeting to be held with the public excluded, will be discussed.

Any additions in accordance with Section 46A(7) must be approved by resolution with an explanation as to why they cannot be delayed until a future meeting.

Any additions in accordance with Section 46A(7A) may be received or referred to a subsequent meeting for further discussion. No resolution, decision or recommendation can be made in respect of a minor item.

3. Submissions from the Maori Ward Consultation

Page 7

Submission, dated 18 September 2017, by John Annabell.

Note:

The submissions have been pre-circulated and Elected Members are asked to bring these to the meeting.

4. Exclusion of Public

To be moved:

“That the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting listed in the table below.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under Section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General subject of each matter to be considered	Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter	Ground(s) under Section 48(1) for passing this resolution

This resolution is made in reliance on Section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by Section 6 or Section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public as stated in the above table.

Also that the persons listed below be permitted to remain after the public has been excluded for the reasons stated.

Chief Executive (Heather Shotter), Chief Financial Officer (Grant Elliott), General Manager, City Enterprises (Ray McIndoe), General Manager, City Future (Sheryl Bryant), General Manager, City Networks (Ray Swadel), General

Manager, Customer Services (Peter Eathorne), General Manager, Libraries and Community Services (Debbie Duncan), Human Resources Manager (Wayne Wilson) and Communications and Marketing Manager (or their representative (name)) because of their knowledge and ability to provide the meeting with advice on matters both from an organisation-wide context (being members of the Council's Management Team) and also from their specific role within the Council.

Legal Counsel (John Annabell), because of his knowledge and ability to provide the meeting with legal and procedural advice.

Governance and Support Team Leader (Kyle Whitfield) and Committee Administrators (Penny Odell, Carly Chang and Rachel Corser), because of their knowledge and ability to provide the meeting with procedural advice and record the proceedings of the meeting.

[Add Council Officers], because of their knowledge and ability to assist the meeting in speaking to their report and answering questions, noting that such officer will be present at the meeting only for the item that relate to their respective report.

[Add Third Parties], because of their knowledge and ability to assist the meeting in speaking to their report/s [or other matters as specified] and answering questions, noting that such person/s will be present at the meeting only for the items that relate to their respective report/s [or matters as specified].

SUBMISSION FROM CONSULTATION

TO: Council

MEETING DATE: 2 October 2017

TITLE: Submissions from the Maori Ward Consultation

FROM: John Annabell, Legal Counsel

ITEM 3

RECOMMENDATION(S) TO COUNCIL

1. That the oral and written submissions on the Māori Ward Consultation be received.
2. Note the Procedures for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the Procedure Sheet as attached.

SUBMITTERS WISHING TO BE HEARD IN SUPPORT OF THEIR SUBMISSION

Sub	Name/Organisation
5	Ms Ruth Jackson
28	Palmerston North Women's Health Collective
30	Mr Martin Sullivan
38	Mr Wheeler
50	Mr Joe Erkens
53	Dr Fred Hirst
58	Hobson's Pledge
64	Mr Allen Kerkham
65	Ms Tina Smith
66	Mrs Steph Hirst
67	Rangitane o Manawatu
69	NZ Public Service Association

SUBMITTERS WISHING NOT TO BE HEARD IN SUPPORT OF THEIR SUBMISSION

ITEM 3

Sub	Name/Organisation
1	Miss Leah Baken
2	Alex R Baker
3	Mr Stephen Paterson
4	Mr Rusev Laumeka
6	Mrs Kathryn Leslie
7	Mr Mark Leslie
8	Mr Bernard R Williams
9	Submission withdrawn
10	Mr Gerard Barnao
11	Mr Ken Baird
12	Mr Steve Pedley
13	Mrs Rachel Pedley
14	Mr Whitiora Paterangi
15	Mr Roy Le Quesne
16	Mr John Shennan
17	Mrs Sharp
18	John McNamara
19	Isabel Karaitiana
20	L B Noaro
21	Mrs Leanne Macdonald
22	Sam
23	Mr Robert Cuff
24	Mr Zeb
25	Mr Chris Phillips
26	Mr Paul Mullinger
27	Mrs Carol Phillips
29	Ian Staples
31	Anne Strafford
32	Mr Kidd

33	Tanenuiarangi Manawatū Incorporated
34	Ms E Cross
35	Mr Eric Constantine
36	Murray
37	Ms Ashleigh Carlyle
39	Ms Anastasia Groube
40	Cathy Hughes
41	Mrs Hannah Mooney
42	Mr R Fitchett
43	Russell Brown
44	Mr Chris Larking
45	Mr Frank Goldingham
46	Ms Joan Pemberton
47	Selwyn Brown
48	Dereck Picking
49	Mrs F E Brown
51	Melissa O'Hagan
52	Mr Rocky Renquist
54	Mr Trevor Donaldson
55	Mrs Clare Callow
56	Mr A Tufuga
57	Tiratahi Taipana
59	Mrs Jan Shepherd
60	Mr Hamilton
61	Inshalah 2007 Ltd
62	Mr John Puklowski
63	Mrs Christine Puklowski
68	Dr Christine Cheyne, School of People, Environment and Planning
70	Unions Manawatū
71	Mr James R Broughton
72	Mrs Annette Newbery
73	Mr Fraser Con

ITEM 3

74	Dion Martin
75	Reverend Rodger Scoones
76	Mr Allan Mudford
77	Mr Peter Mockett
78	Mr Robert Goddard
79	Mr Raoul Christensen
80	Mr Kerry Beets
81	Ms Te Rina Warren
82	Mr R N Sandbrook
83	Mrs Margaret Cleghorn
84	Mr Keith Robinson
85	Mrs Marlene Rough
86	Miss Stephanie G Brown
87	Mr John Whitelock
88	Mrs Angela Joblin
89	Donald Rix
90	Stewart H Picken
91	Palmerston North Community Services Council Inc
92	Mrs Sandra Stuart
93	Mrs Mohi

1. ISSUE

The immediate task of the Council is to receive the oral and written submissions arising from the Māori Ward consultation.

2. BACKGROUND

Earlier this year, the Council approved a discussion document as a basis for consultation on possible Māori ward options for the city and invited public submissions on this document. Submissions were invited from Tuesday 1 August through to Friday 15 September 2017. The consultation information was published on the Council's website, made available at the Council office and libraries, and two consultation meetings were held. A total of 93 submissions were received, but one has since been withdrawn.

3. ANALYSIS OF SUBMISSIONS

The table below presents information on the support for a Māori Ward (or wards) in terms of the numbers and percentages of submissions received.

Responses	Number	%
Submissions supporting a Māori ward	32	34.8
Submissions opposing a Māori ward	59	64.1
No response	1	1.1
Total	92	100.0

Of the submissions received 72 indicated that they were on the General Electoral Roll and 9 indicated that they were on the Māori Roll.

While this analysis presents an overview of the submissions, it should not be taken as a substitute for reading the submissions themselves. Further, no attempt has been made to cover every issue raised or argument made. Where a quotations or comments are included in this analysis, they are intended as representative statements, rather than being a complete or near-complete list of comments.

While the discussion document was made available in both English and Te Reo, only one submission (24) was made in Te Reo. A translation has been provided.

Representative comments advanced in favour of the Māori wards (or wards) included:

- Māori should have special rights. They have the legal right to them. The New Zealand government and local governments may not have been the parties who signed the Treaty, but they are responsible for upholding it. And they have massively failed. (1)
- We are one nation and we should recognise that Māori as the tangata whenua have an explicit right to representation to ensure the ongoing commitment to bi-culturalism that underpins our Treaty responsibilities. (16)
- We have been very aware that there has been an absence of Māori representation on Council for quite a number of years now. We are also concerned that the move to city wide voting makes Māori representation even less likely. When we did have Māori representation on Council such as Yvonne Marshall and Waana Davis, they came from Wards that were in parts of Palmerston North with more concentrated Māori populations. The change to the city wide structure has made it more difficult for Māori councillors to be elected. (28)

ITEM 3

- TMI is in favour of the establishment of Māori Wards in Palmerston North. By the establishment of these Wards it shall give Māori in the City a real opportunity to participate in local government decision at the highest levels. As Māori we have a great cultural understanding of our perspectives and the many issues that face us which can be articulated at the Council table, the Māori Ward option would afford us. As Māori we also have solutions to many of the issues that face us. Many times we would share the same outcomes for our City but the paths we take may sometimes be a little different because of our cultural make up. (33)
- Justification supporting this proposal includes inequitable representation by Māori within the Council currently; the need to more effectively respond to the needs of Māori, and others within the PN population with high levels of socioeconomic deprivation by increased representation, and the value of Māori stewardship, traditional knowledge and responsible governance as custodians of the environment (kaitiakitanga) within the PNCC. (53)
- It is important we have good representation from Māori in Palmerston North and that there is a strong Māori voice on our City Council. As a community we need to work in partnership with Māori and respect their place and participation. While it is good that PNCC work with local Iwi and Iwi representatives, there are many Māori here that come from other places who also need to feel that there is an avenue for their voice to be heard. (65)
- This will ensure Māori representation as tangata whenua under the Treaty of Waitangi and provide their perspective to Council. I find many NZ Pakeha do not have sufficient knowledge regarding the Treaty to give informed opinions; either because Māori history was inadequately taught at school level and/or 'Treaty Training' courses were not undertaken as adults. (66)
- I am aware of, and support, the diversity of 'ad hoc' governance arrangements that are now being established by councils throughout New Zealand, sometimes as a result of Treaty settlements. However, alongside these is needed guaranteed representation via the mechanism of a Māori ward(s) which is an option currently provided in legislation. (68)
- We submit that utilising the Māori Electoral Roll as the determinant of voting rights for Council elections provides the clearest and neatest option for broad and effective representation of Māori, while acknowledging that mana whenua are actively working with Local Government to develop more specific and appropriate ways of ensuring their distinct interests are secured. (69 & 70)
- Having a Māori Ward would provide a direct Māori voice on the Council because Māori people do form a significant community of interest in PNth. (74)
- Even though society has made strides in the last thirty years towards giving Māori a semblance of Mana Motuhake, without a voice in local government, those strides mean little, because it's at a local level that active participation by

Māori can result in positive outcomes. Central government seems too remote for most of us. (79)

- The establishment of Māori wards fits with our Te Tiriti o Waitangi Policy, which states our commitment to supporting Māori involvement in the decision-making process and supporting common goals with Māori. (91)

Representative comments advanced in opposition of the Māori ward (or wards) included:

- To create Māori ward, is creating a racial entity, in the face of democracy, thus exposing the community yet another form of disharmony. I am of the feeling that those who wish to serve their fellow citizens are able to do so without a designated seat, this is not the pathway to Māori progress. (2)
- All councillors should be elected on a city wide basis. No other considerations such as race should come into it. (7)
- Palmerston North is moving away from discriminating "them and us" values and becoming a community where everybody regardless of race or religion gets treated the same. By bringing back "Māori Only" Wards, is a away of moving backwards and creating division. (13)
- I believe that we are "one people" made up of individuals from all corners of the World and to have Māori Wards is going down the path of elit-ism. I do not wish to be part of a culture that promotes one culture over another. If this proposal was to come to part then why would there not be French, Welsh, Scottish, Muslim, Catholic, Anglican, Australian wards? (15)
- A seat on a Council should be earned - all candidates should be equal and should stand on their Merits. There are many fine Politicians who are Māori who have been elected because they are fine outstanding citizens who have a lot to offer society. (17)
- Māori rights already exist. If people of Māori extraction want to stand for Council, no one is stopping them. They are part of the democratic process like everyone else. (20)
- If you're going to create a Māori ward, why stop there? Why not make a ward for every ethnic group in NZ? Everyone in NZ must be treated as equals, abide by the same laws and have exactly the same representation. (22)
- Despite much talk to the contrary, Māori are no more special than anyone else. Yes, they are respected and important to our community, but that's the same as all ethnic groups. We are all equal people, and no ethnic group deserve special treatment over others. (51)
- This is a submission against a proposal by the Palmerston North City Council to set up a Māori ward because there is no evidence that this is a step strongly desired by Māori roll voters, because sufficient opportunities for all citizens are

ITEM 3

available to contribute to decision-making processes, and because Māori wards set up elsewhere have not increased participation by Māori voters. (58)

- My thesis is that we should not change a model that has not been given the time to prove itself and appears to give all cultures the opportunity to make their issues known and be and be subject to the scrutiny of public debate and vote. (75)
- Creating special wards for specific sub groups or minorities can lead to fragmentation and division rather than inclusiveness. The logic of creating wards to serve minorities is uncertain and opens the door to demands by any self-important minority to have its own specific ward and councillor(s). (76)
- Since the adoption of city wide voting the city has progressed slowly to the well run city we have today. Any form of ward representation I believe would be a backward step. (89)

A number of submissions suggested that the Council might or should consider holding a poll – see submissions 10, 11, 44, 58, 82, 88 and 90.

Several other submissions commented on how the Council could interact with the Māori community by other means – see submissions 19, 26 and 67.

Two submissions commented that they believed that two Māori wards should be established – see submissions 28 and 91.

Several submissions included a detailed analysis of the concerns of Māori, see for example, submission 71.

4. NEXT STEPS

The Council is expected to make a final decision on the Māori ward option at its meeting to be held at 9am on Tuesday 24 October 2017. At that meeting, the Council will have the option of retaining the present system, establishing a Māori ward or wards, or alternatively could decide to conduct a poll instead.

If the Council decides to establish a Māori ward or wards, the number of Māori councillors and ward boundaries will be finalised as part of the representative review which is to be carried out next year.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Council Procedure Sheet for Submissions on Maori Ward 2 October 2017





PROCEDURE SHEET

HEARING OF SUBMISSIONS ON THE MAORI WARD CONSULTATION

Presenting your submission

You have indicated a wish to present your submission in person at a meeting of the Council. You may speak to your submission yourself or, if you wish, arrange for some other person or persons to speak on your behalf.

We would like this meeting to be relatively informal. We recommend that you speak to the main points of your submission and then answer any questions. It is not necessary to read your submission as Council members have a copy and will have already read it.

Questions are for clarifying matters raised in submissions. Questions may only be asked by Council members, unless the Chairperson gives permission.

Time Allocation

10 minutes (including question time) will be allocated for the hearing of each submission. If more than one person speaks to a submission, the time that is allocated to that submission will be shared between the speakers.

Who will be there?

The Council will hear the submissions. Council comprises of 16 elected members – as identified on the frontispiece of the Agenda.

There will also be other people there who are presenting their submission. The Hearing is open to the media and the public.

Agenda

An Agenda for the meeting at which you will be speaking will be available on the Council website www.pncc.govt.nz. The Agenda lists the submissions in the order they will be considered by the Council, although there may be some variation to this.

Venue

The meeting will be held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, The Square, Palmerston North.

The Council Chamber will be set out with tables arranged appropriately. You will be invited to sit at the table with the Councillors when called.

Tikanga Maori

You may speak to your submission in Maori if you wish. If you intend to do so, please contact us **no later than four working days before the date of the meeting** (refer to the "Further Information" section below). This is to enable arrangements to be made for a certified interpreter to attend the meeting. You may bring your own interpreter if you wish.

Visual Aids	A whiteboard, and computer with PowerPoint will be available for your use. If you require any other equipment, please contact the Officer named below in the "Further information" section no later than 10.00am on Friday 29 September 2017 and we will try and supply it for you.
Final Consideration of Submissions	All submissions will be considered at the ordinary meeting of Council to be held at 9.00am on Monday, 24 October 2017. The media and public can attend these meetings, but it will not be possible for you to speak further to your submission, or participate in the Council deliberations.
Changes to this Procedure	Council may, in its sole discretion, vary the procedure set out above if circumstances indicate that some other procedure would be more appropriate.
Further Information	If you have any questions about the procedure outlined above, please contact Kyle Whitfield, Governance and Support Team Leader, telephone 06 356-8199 or email kyle.whitfield@pncc.govt.nz

* * * * *