

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Committee of Council (Hearing of Submissions on the Annual Budget 2022-23) Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on:

Tuesday 10 May 2022 – 9.00am, 3.30pm and 7.00pm

Thursday 12 May 2022 – 9.00am and 3.30pm

Friday 13 May 2022 – 3.30pm

The meeting commenced at 9.00am.

Members Present: The Mayor (Grant Smith) (in the Chair) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Apologies: Councillors Vaughan Dennison and Karen Naylor.

4-22 Apologies: Session 1 - 9am, 10 May 2022

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 4-22 above was carried

5-22 Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the extraordinary Committee of Council meeting of 2 March 2022 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 5-22 above was carried.

6-22 Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

1. That the minutes of the Committee of Council meeting of 23 June 2021 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 6-22 above was carried.

7-22 Appointment of Chairs for following sessions

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the chairs for the remaining sessions be agreed as follows:

Tuesday 10 May, 3.30pm to 5.30pm: Cr Patrick Handcock
Tuesday 10 May, 7.00pm to 9.00pm: Cr Zulfiqar Butt
Thursday 12 May, 9.00am to 11.00am: Cr Karen Naylor
Thursday 12 May, 3.30pm to 5.30pm: Cr Bruno Petrenas
Thursday 12 May, 7.00pm to 9.00pm: Cr Renee Dingwall
Friday 13 May, 3.30pm to 5.30pm: Deputy Mayor Aleisha Rutherford

Clause 7-22 above was carried.

8-22 Extension of Meeting Time

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That as per Standing Order 2.1.7 the meeting be extended until 6.00pm on Friday 13 May 2022.

Clause 8-22 above was carried.

9-22 Submissions to the Annual Budget 2022-23: Session 1

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee hear submissions from presenters who indicated their wish to be heard in support of their submission.
2. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 9-22 above was carried.

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Committee and made oral

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members, the additional points being:

Paul Perry (130):

Paul spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

James Russell (122):

James spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

Water Safety New Zealand (173):

Dan Gerrard, Rob Hewitt and Caron Mounsey-Smith spoke to the submission and made the following additional comments:

- Leading a joint initiative with iwi, council staff from PNCC and Horizons Regional Council and Police to change the behaviour of New Zealanders around fresh water and locally to reduce the number of drownings in the Manawatū Awa.
- Joint initiative to focus on:
 - Formalising protocols of rāhui with the public
 - Improving Signage at rivers – eg infographics. Working closely with English language school to improve signage for second language speakers
 - Ongoing education – opportunities to build
 - Conduct 3-4 risk assessments of popular swimming holes in Manawatū to be presented with a report to Council.
- The local body of Surf lifesaving NZ has been contacted to see if they could share skills with local groups.
- Seeking funding of \$25,000 for Year one of the initiative.
- Funding required for Financial Year 2022/23.

The meeting adjourned at 9.50am

The meeting resumed at 10.08am

Emma Ochei (266):

Emma spoke to her submission and made the following additional comments:

- Not representing the Toy Library this is an individual submission.
- Advocated for the increase in remuneration for staff as it's important to be able to retain staff. From her experience working in the community sector, it is important to be able to build a strong relationship with council staff which is difficult to do if the council liaison officers keep changing.
- Being left on hold for 4 minutes to talk to someone at the call centre isn't good for the reputation of the council as it makes Council appear inaccessible.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

- Beggars approaching people while sitting in cafes isn't great - not great for the city or cafes.
- Hancock House – funding decrease to 61K from 63K proposed in LTP is effectively a cut.
- Covid relief funding still needed – many community groups are low on funds, having used up their reserves in the last two years. The focus is on providing the basics to the most vulnerable. Don't want to see the loss of these organisations that encourage community cohesion.

The meeting adjourned at 10:22 am.

The meeting resumed at 10:29 am.

The meeting adjourned (Session 1 finished) at 10:30 am.

The meeting resumed (Session 2 started) at 3:30 pm.

Members Present: Councillor Patrick Handcock ONZM (in the Chair), the Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

10-22 Submissions to the Annual Budget 2022-23: Session 2

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 10-22 above carried.

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members, the additional points being:

Lindsay Gray (61):

Lindsay spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

Disability Reference Group (285):

Nick Dow and Hugh O'Connell spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- The DRG would like to see more accessibility funding budgeted for the coming year on top of the NZ\$100,000 already in the

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

budget. A figure between NZ\$250,000 to 300,000 should be considered to increase the scope of the facilities review beyond the Building Code and Council owned buildings.

- Also, to address a general misunderstanding amongst Council Officers in terms of what the DRG refers to as a general accessibility audit, the DRG would like a Workshop session between the DRG and the Council Officers to discuss what DRG is seeking and what is realistic to achieve within the budget allocated for.

Te Hā o Hine-ahu-one Palmerston North Women's Health Collective (306):

Jean Hera spoke to the submission and made no additional comments.

Environment Network Manawatu (325):

Helen King spoke to the submission and made no additional comments.

The meeting adjourned at 4:10 pm.

The meeting resumed at 4:30 pm.

Richard Bedford (310):

Richard spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

Further information was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

The meeting adjourned (Session 2 finished) at 4:49 pm.

The meeting resumed (Session 3 started) at 7:10 pm.

Members Present: Councillor Zulfiqar Butt (in the Chair), the Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

11-22 Submissions to the Annual Budget 2022-23: Session 3

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 11-22 above carried.

The meeting adjourned at 7:11 pm.

The meeting resumed at 7:20 pm.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following person appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of his submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members, the additional points being:

Deniz Gultekin (123):

Deniz spoke to his submission and made the following additional comment:

- The roads in Longburn and around Palmerton North are of poor quality and should be fixed.

The meeting adjourned (Session 3 finished) at 7:33 pm.

The meeting resumed (Session 4 started) at 9:08 am Thursday 12 May 2022.

Members Present: Councillor Karen Naylor (in the Chair), the Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

12-22 Submissions to the Annual Budget 2022-23: Session 4

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 12-22 above carried.

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members, the additional points being:

Tony Passman (129):

Tony spoke to his submission and made no additional comments. Further information (Powerpoint presentation and a hard copy of a map of a property) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

River Stop Awapuni (197):

David Chapple and Annette Nixon spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

Ngāti Hineaute Hapu Authority (126):

Christopher Whaiapu spoke to the submission and made the following additional comments:

- The River Rangers concept was first mooted as a prevention measure due to the increase of foot traffic along with the entire river space.
- The Rangers concept is to have somebody's physical presence in each of the river locations throughout the day, in particular, the summer and hotter months when a lot more people visit those sites, especially spots where people can access the river which are otherwise unmonitored.
- The River Rangers proposal is best suited to fit within the current Te Motu O Poutua Management Plan, the River Park and the River Framework rather than begging a whole new project and being included in the LTP for 2024. The costs are not to be included in the Annual Budget, but funding to be included into the Management Plan for Te Motu O Poutua.
- Rangers, as a new concept has been taken from both the Department of Conservation and Greater Wellington Council models. Rangers would do all sorts of tasks related to the maintenance, safety, security and preservation of the river space and their remuneration would be from \$42,000 to \$50,000 (junior) and \$65,000 to \$90,000 (senior).
- Other Agencies such as the Manawatū River leaders, the Green Corridors, Manawatū Striders, Horizons Regional Council, Manawatū District Council, Tararua District Council, DoC, Water Safety NZ, internally Rangitāne, and other community groups have been included in the discussion of the Rangitāne River Rangers.
- Alternative solutions were proposed as well such as an Ambassador Programme, very similar to the City Ambassador Programme; also, could some Lifeguards be deployed from the Lido, Guides, voluntary workers groups formed to monitor some aspects of the river, however, those would be only voluntary initiatives largely at the risk of availability of the volunteers.
- In Summer months, the concept could be that the Rangers would be needed seven days for two Rangers, one to monitor or patrol the eastern bank all the way up to Te Āpiti and another Ranger covering the western side from Te Motu O Poutua river side all the way to Linton.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

Environment Network Manawatū- the Manawatū Food Action Network (326):

Daniel Morrimire spoke to the submission and made no additional comments.

The meeting adjourned at 10:15 am.

The meeting resumed at 10:30 am

Malcolm Frith (340):

Malcolm spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- The rates should not be increased and some measures should be adopted to decrease Council expenditure such as:
 - Reducing costs on outsourcing – consultants, designers etc. – because contractors cost more, and they don't know the realities of the city e.g. Hospital entrance facing the wrong side.
 - Stop wasting time debating unimportant issues instead debate important issues e.g. dangerous intersections yet to be looked after.

Mike Clement (90):

Mike spoke to his submission and made no additional comments.

The meeting adjourned (Session 4 finished) at 10:52 am.

The meeting resumed (Session 5 started) at 3.30pm Thursday 12 May 2022.

Members Present: Councillor Bruno Petrenas (in the Chair), the Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Aleisha Rutherford.

Apologies Councillor Leonie Hapeta (early departure)

13-22 Apologies: Session 5, 3.30pm, 12 May 2022

Moved Bruno Petrenas, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the apologies be received.

Clause 13-22 above was carried.

14-22 Submissions to the Annual Budget 2022-23: Session 5

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

Moved Bruno Petrenas, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 14-22 above was carried.

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members, the additional points being:

Memorial Park Sports Trust Board (298):

Sandi Nimmo spoke to the submission and made no additional comments.

Malcolm Prince (105):

Malcolm spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- There is no fairness in the rating system considering everyone uses the same city services.
- Had emailed all of the Elected Members and only Councillors Barrett and Johnson replied to him.
- Properties like his with trees, grass and shrubs should be rewarded for being eco-friendly.
- Proposes that PNCC set a general rates increase of 6.9% in line with inflation. Use a capital rating system.

Richard Wilde (207):

Malcolm Prince read Richard's submission on his behalf and made the following additional comments:

- The land value rating is not fit for purpose and does not reflect the costs of delivery of city services. The value of a particular parcel of land alone is not relevant to the costs of running the city in 2022.
- It is what occupies the land that better represents the costs to the city services.
- Adopting the Capital Value Rating system would spread the rating burden to the owners of the large expensive properties, who are currently sheltering behind their lower land values but much larger capital values.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

- Concerned about the increase of infill within the city, which could lead to the requirement of upgrading the present stormwater system, adding to future rate burdens.

Palmerston North Youth Council (287):

Caragh (Chair) and Lucas (Treasurer) spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments. Further information (Powerpoint presentation) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

- They had over 230 responses from young people around the city on their survey they conducted on active transport, connected & safe communities and eco-city.
- They shared the statistics and information that came from their survey.

Rod Pik (174):

Rod and Vanja Pavarno spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments. Further information (Powerpoint presentation) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

- Vogel Street is too dangerous to cross or cycle on.
- There were no plans to improve the safety of the streets.
- There has been a sudden increase of traffic, including trucks, over the last five years with only one pedestrian crossing on the whole street.
- The street is narrow and often there are parked cars on both sides of the street, which leaves no room for cyclists.
- Concerned about where the new Freight Hub is going, which will increase heavy traffic even more.
- Vogel Street urgently requires road markings that slow traffic, limited carparking, bypass route for trucks, controlled intersections, safe places for pedestrians to cross and cycle lanes.

Councillor Vaughan Dennison left the meeting at 4.38pm.

Martia Alico (181):

Martia spoke to her submission and made no additional comments.

15-22

Re-appointment of Chair for Session 6

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

1. That Councillor Renee Dingwall be agreed to Chair the Friday 13 May, 3.30pm to 5.30pm session.

Clause 15-22 above was carried.

The meeting adjourned (Session 5 finished) at 4.47pm.

The meeting resumed (Session 6 started) at 3.30pm Friday 13 May 2022.

Members Present: Councillors Renee Dingwall (in the Chair), Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Apologies The Mayor (absent on Council business), Councillors Susan Baty and Leonie Hapeta.

16-22 **Apologies: Session 6 – 3.30pm, 13 May 2022**

Moved Patrick Handcock ONZM, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the apologies be received.

Clause 16-22 above was carried.

Councillor Vaughan Dennison entered the meeting at 3.34pm.

17-22 **Submissions to the Annual Budget 2022-23: Session 6**

Moved Patrick Handcock ONZM, seconded Rachel Bowen.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 17-22 above was carried.

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget (Plan) 2022/23 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Committee and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members, the additional points being:

Robert Dabb (296):

Robert spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- Would like to see a system where no-one pays less rates than last

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

year and no-one pays over 10% than last year, applied to both the residential and commercial sectors.

- Suggested Council go back to 2018 valuations and apply an 8% increase (or whatever it is) across the board.
- Land value system is outdated and not fit for purpose; people live in houses, not sections.

Central Palmerston North Business Improvement District Inc. (Palmy BID) (319):

Rob Campbell spoke to the submission and made the following additional comments:

- Some would say that the role of security in the city centre should fall to the Police, but this is not the 1960s when Police resources were vastly greater relative to population size and the nature of crime.
- With respect to City Ambassadors - while we wait for someone else to take ownership we lose our children to gangs, we put our people at risk and discourage investment in the heart of the city.
- Palmy BID does not have the mandate to take over funding for this programme.

Manawatū Business Chamber (336):

Amanda Linsley & Steve Davey spoke to the submission and made the following additional comments:

- It was concerning to see the number of submissions from individuals whose personal proposed rate increase due to their land valuation is very high.
- Whilst MBC have always supported realistic rate valuations and acknowledged the necessity to invest in infrastructure, so as to manage growth sustainably, we do feel that Council needs to review its rates proposal and seek to cut costs this year; reflect, review and take stock of where we are.
- An additional budget for employee remuneration should be reviewed on an individual basis based on performance this year.
- Keen to be kept updated on what 3 Waters means for our city in terms of infrastructure, ownership and potential costs and benefits.
- With respect to the Civic and Cultural Precinct project, whilst we endorse the concept, we feel it is important that costs are clearly articulated and that everyone appreciates this is a long-term plan and a collaboration.
- We encourage Council to be aspirational and to consider new ways of doing things .

Dale O'Reilly (314):

Dale O'Reilly spoke to her submission and made the following additional

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 10 MAY 2022

comments:

- The burden of a large rates increase is a little cruel in the current economic climate.
- It seems that the planning for the PNITl group of work makes up a large proportion of this year's rates increase and surely needs to be reassessed.
- In terms of being referred to by PNCC as part of one community, it was obviously speaking from a place where the word community refers to the entire jurisdiction of PNCC because no-one from Bunnythorpe was included in any of the discussions that led to either the 2010 Joint Transport Strategy or the PNITl group of projects, nor any of the freight hub workshops that were held.
- Another example of Council not acknowledging the individual history and makeup of their outlying communities is that it did not challenge an expert witness of KiwiRail's social impact expert that resulted in the consideration on which the panel of commissioners concluded that KiwiRail go ahead with their notice of requirement.
- If we had a community board (which has been requested) the manipulation of statistics within planning would be picked up on.
- What Bunnythorpe needs is a meeting dedicated specifically for PNCC representatives to speak candidly and honestly to the people of Bunnythorpe about the northeast industrial zone, the PNITl and the regional freight ring road.

The meeting closed at 4.17pm, Friday 13 May 2022

Confirmed 26 May 2022

Chairperson