

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Committee of Council Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 26 May 2022, commencing at 9.00am

Members Present: The Mayor (Grant Smith) (in the Chair) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Apologies: Councillor Lew Findlay (late arrival).

Councillor Lew Findlay entered the meeting at 9.41am during consideration of clause 21. He was not present when the meeting resumed at 11.00am. He entered the meeting again at 11.50am during consideration of clause 21. He was not present for clauses 18 to 20 inclusive.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 12.17pm during consideration of clause 22.3. She entered the meeting again at 12.33pm during consideration of clause 22.4. She was not present for clause 22.3.

Councillor Rachel Bowen left the meeting at 4.15pm during consideration of clause 24.1. She entered the meeting again at 4.36pm during consideration of clause 24.5. She was not present for clauses 24.1 to 24.4 inclusive.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta left the meeting at 4.59pm during consideration of clause 24.9. She was not present for clause 24.9.

18-22 Apologies

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The COMMITTEE RESOLVED

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 18-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

19-22 **Additional Items**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the late items be received.
 - Schedule B – replacement
 - Schedule C

Reasons for lateness:

Short timeframe to gather information in response to submissions.

Reasons items should be taken:

Attachments inform the context and options for budget deliberations.

Clause 19-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

20-22 **Confirmation of Minutes**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the Committee of Council meeting of 10 May 2022 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 20-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

21-22 **2022/23 Annual Budget - Moving Forward**

Memorandum, presented by Steve Paterson, Strategy Manager – Finance, Chris Dyhrberg, Acting Chief Executive and Cameron McKay, Chief Financial Officer.

Councillor Lew Findlay entered the meeting at 9.41am.

The meeting adjourned at 10.41am.

The meeting resumed at 11.00am.

Councillor Lew Findlay was not present when the meeting resumed.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Councillor Lew Findlay entered the meeting again at 11.50am.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council receive:

- a. the Engagement Summary (Attachment 1).
- b. the Summary of Submissions (Attachment 2).
- c. Officer Comments to the Summary of Submissions (Attachment 3).

Clause 21-22 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

22-22

Rating

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council note Attachment 4: Schedule A – Rating incidence & proposed changes to the rating system.

Clause 22-22 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That Council increase the rating differential for commercial/industrial property from 180% to 200%.

Clause 22-22 above was carried 14 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Against:

Councillors Susan Baty and Leonie Hapeta.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 12.17pm.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That the Uniform Annual General Charge is reduced from \$300 to \$200.

Clause 22-22 above was carried 14 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillor Karen Naylor.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford entered the meeting again at 12.33pm.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

4. That Council write to the Valuer-General expressing frustration and concern over the process used in the recent valuation of Palmerston North City.

Clause 22-22 above was carried 13 votes to 2, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Susan Baty and Karen Naylor.

Abstained:

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford.

The meeting adjourned at 12.41pm.

The meeting resumed at 1.49pm.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

23-22 One-Off Operating Programmes

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce programme 2133 – Health and Safety Improvement Programme – to \$300k (funded through 21/22 surplus). The motion was lost 5 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Lew Findlay QSM, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council include a programme to complete the Accessibility Assessment of Council infrastructure - \$200k, and that this is funded from the 2021/22 surplus (Re. Submission 285 – Accessibility Assessment).

Clause 23-22 above was carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

Councillor Bruno Petrenas.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Renee Dingwall.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That the Chief Executive establish a new programme to provide water safety improvements at the Manawātū River as recommended by Water Safety New Zealand with a budget of \$15,000 in the FY 2022-23 and this be funded from the 2021/22 surplus.

Clause 23-22 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

Note:

An amendment was made on clause 23.3 that the word 'removing' be replaced with 'including' and the words 'increasing up to a maximum of \$200k' be added after the word 'Case'.

The amendment was carried 10 votes to 6, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Lew Findlay QSM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That Council agree Attachment 5: Schedule B – Schedule of one-off operating programmes
 - Including programme 2025 – Urban Bus Terminal Business Case increasing up to a maximum of \$200k, and
 - Adding Accessibility Assessment and Water Safety programmes, and

Note that 2021/22 surplus be applied.

Clause 23-22 above was carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

Councillor Karen Naylor.

24-22

Operational Budget Changes

The meeting adjourned at 3.38pm.

The meeting resumed at 3.54pm.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the proposed additional budget for employee remuneration be reduced by \$2,000k to enable \$4,792k additional for the 2022/23 year. That the application of the additional \$4,792k remuneration is

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

determined by the Chief Executive.

Councillor Rachel Bowen left the meeting at 4.15pm.

Clause 24-22 above was carried 8 votes to 7, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 4 in the following budget lines:
 - 2133 – Health and Safety Improvement Programme
 - MSL – Business Assurance Consultancy
 - MSL – Minor Budget Corrections
 - MSL – Waste Levy Income

Clause 24-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:
 - 1431 - Walkways and shared paths – art and heritage trails

Clause 24-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

4. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:
- 1914 – Electronic District Plan

Clause 24-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Rachel Bowen entered the meeting again at 4.36pm.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

5. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:
- 1878 – Active Transport Innovation

Clause 24-22 above was carried 10 votes to 6, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

6. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:
- 2130 – Heritage Advisory Panel

Clause 24-22 above was carried 14 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillor Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

7. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:

- 1936 – Section 17a Review

Clause 24-22 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line: MSL – Agenda printing. The motion was tied 8 votes to 8. The chairperson declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

8. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:

- 1935 – Cats – Public Education and Colonies Management

Clause 24-22 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty and Lorna Johnson.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta left the meeting at 4.59pm.

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

9. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 3 in the following budget line:
- 1264 – Development Contributions Fees – Support for Community Groups

Clause 24-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

The meeting adjourned at 5.00pm.

The meeting resumed at 9.00am on Friday 27 May 2022.

9am, Friday 27 May 2022

Members Present: The Mayor (Grant Smith) (in the Chair) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Apologies: Councillors Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad (early departure after 2pm) and Rachel Bowen (early departure).

Councillor Orphée Mickalad was not present when the meeting resumed at 11.22am. He was present when the meeting resumed at 1.32pm. He left the meeting at 2.48pm at the conclusion of clause 27. He was not present for clauses 27.1 and 28 to 31 inclusive.

Councillor Lew Findlay left the meeting at 3.36pm at the conclusion of clause 28.1. He entered the meeting again at 3.48pm. He was present for all clauses.

25-22 Apologies - 27 May 2022

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the apologies be received.

Clause 25-22 above was carried.

26-22 Operational Budget Changes continued

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line:
 - MSL – Palmy Proud

Clause 26-22 above was carried 8 votes to 7, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line:
 - 1167 – Placemaking co-created project

Clause 26-22 above was carried 12 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison and Leonie Hapeta.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line: 1447 – Earthquake prone heritage building fund. The motion was lost 6 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

Note:

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line: MSL – Living Lab. The motion was lost 4 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line: 1480 – Sponsorship opportunities for Council with economic benefits. The motion was lost 6 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Lorna Johnson and Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line:

- 1724 – Citywide diversion of waste from landfill investigation studies

Clause 26-22 above was carried 11 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line: 1145 – Green Corridors Project – Continued Development. The motion was lost 3 votes to 12, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lew Findlay QSM.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line: 1464 – Massey Arts Funding. The motion was lost 1 votes to 14, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillor Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line: 1501 – Public Sculptures Trust Funding – from \$50,000 to \$25,000 (noting difference to Schedule C). The motion was lost 5 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Karen Naylor.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

4. That Council reduce operational expenditure according to Schedule C – Category 2 in the following budget line:
 - 1246 – Three Waters Public Education – Water – reduce by \$41,400

Clause 26-22 above was carried 10 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

Note:

On a motion that the International Relations budget is reduced by \$85k for one year only (leaving \$416k included). The motion was lost 5 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

5. That Programme 1273 – Palmy Unleashed is reduced to \$40k for one year only.

Clause 26-22 above was carried 8 votes to 7, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

Note:

On a motion that Programme 1899 – Aquatic facilities and water recreation preliminary feasibility study \$51k is deferred until 2023/24. The motion was lost 3

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

votes to 12, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

The meeting adjourned at 11.00am.

The meeting resumed at 11.22am.

Councillor Orphée Mickalad was not present when the meeting resumed.

27-22

Capital Budget Changes (Capital New Programmes)

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Karen Naylor.

Note:

On a motion that the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24: Programme 167 – James Line Improvements \$1,443k. The motion was tied 7 votes to 7. The chairperson declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Lorna Johnson and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24:

- Programme 2122 – Streets for People \$2,924k

Clause 27-22 above was carried 13 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford.

The meeting adjourned at 12.27pm.

The meeting resumed at 1.32pm.

Councillor Orphée Mickalad was present when the meeting resumed.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

Note:

On a motion that the following programme is changed: Programme 1552 – Animal Shelter – remove increase of \$1,205k, retaining the \$2,125k allocated. That the Chief Executive review the programme's scope and footprint, and report back to Committee of Council on 15 June 2022 on options for cost reductions. The motion was lost 5 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24:
 - Programme 1435 – Manawatū River Park – Waterfront Precinct Lighting - \$890k

Clause 27-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24:
 - Programme 1707 – City-wide – land purchase associated with streams and channels - \$207k

Clause 27-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

Note:

On a motion that the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24: Programme 1826 – CAB – Workplace Transformation - \$308k. The motion was

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

lost 7 votes to 8, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

4. That the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24:

- Programme 1844 – City Growth – City Reserves – Manawatū River Park - \$703k

Clause 27-22 above was carried 13 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

Note:

On a motion that the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24: Programme 1121 – Tennent Drive Improvements – Food HQ & Massey - \$131k . The motion was lost 4 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Zulfiqar Butt, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

Note:

On a motion that the following capital programme is deferred to 2023/24: Programme 1330 – Placemaking Co-created project - \$16k. The motion was lost 3 votes to 12, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Lew Findlay QSM, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Aleisha Rutherford, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

5. That a budget of up to \$100k (capital) and \$50k (OP EX) for 2 years (\$300k total) is added to address street racer issues.

Clause 27-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

6. That the funding for tree planting in programme 1099 Parks and Reserves Shade Development be brought forward from years 4-10, to a maximum of \$40,000 annually.

Clause 27-22 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Orphée Mickalad left the meeting at 2.48pm.

28-22 Capital Budget Changes (Renewal Programmes)

Moved Susan Baty, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. To increase the annual footpath renewal/maintenance budget by \$150k.

Clause 28-22 above was carried 12 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillor Karen Naylor.

The meeting adjourned at 3.03pm.

The meeting resumed at 3.20pm.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce the following programme: 1512 – CCTV replacements reduce to \$300k. The motion was lost 5 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Lorna Johnson and Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Lew Findlay left the meeting at 3.36pm.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Bruno Petrenas.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce the following programme: 188 – City Library Replacement and Purchase of Library Materials - \$775k – reduce to \$700k . The motion was lost 2 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Lew Findlay entered the meeting again at 3.48pm.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce the following programme: 53 – Computer Replacement – Rolling Replacements \$508k – reduce to \$400k. The motion was tied 7 votes to 7. The chairperson declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Lorna Johnson and Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison,

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

Note:

On a motion that Council reduce the following programme: 1965 – Arena Kitchen Equipment Replacement to \$75k. The motion was lost 4 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Renee Dingwall, Lorna Johnson and Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That Council reduce the following programme:

- 40 – Noise Measuring Equipment for Noise Complaints – Rolling Replacement to \$20k.

Clause 28-22 above was carried 9 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Renee Dingwall, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM and Aleisha Rutherford.

29-22

Capital Budget Changes

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council agree Schedule E – Carry Forward Changes and Schedule F – Capital Expenditure Changes, subject to clauses 27.1 to 27.6 and 28.1 to 28.2 inclusive.

Clause 29-22 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

30-22 Actions proposed in direct response to submissions

Moved Patrick Handcock ONZM, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That an additional sum of \$34,000 is reinstated to support the City Ambassador Programme (Programme Number 1539) for the 2022/23 year.

Clause 30-22 above was carried 10 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson and Bruno Petrenas.

Against:

Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Karen Naylor and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Rachel Bowen.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That the Chief Executive report to Council with a staged plan to address the road safety concerns in Vogel Street as raised by petitioners in Submission 174, including information on community engagement, budget and timing.

Clause 30-22 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

3. That the Chief Executive report to Council on options and resource needs for place-based village planning at Awapuni and other neighbourhood centres.

Clause 30-22 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

4. That the Chief Executive report to Council with a plan to improve safety at College Street and Botanical Road, including right hand turn lanes and provision for active transport.

Clause 30-22 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

5. That a budget of \$15k be established to support design work for a Botanical Road/College Street safety improvement plan.

Clause 30-22 above was carried 11 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta and Karen Naylor.

Moved Renee Dingwall, seconded Lew Findlay QSM.

Note:

On a motion that the Chief Executive establish a Disability, Pasifika and Seniors Reference Group budget line of \$10,000 for volunteer support such as food at meetings, petrol vouchers or koha as needed. The motion was tied 7 votes to 7. The chairperson declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta and Lorna Johnson.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

31-22

Changes to Assumptions

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Aleisha Rutherford.

COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL - PART I - 26 MAY 2022

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council agree to change the interest rate assumption to 3.4%.

Clause 31-22 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Renee Dingwall, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

The meeting finished at 5.00pm

Confirmed 15 June 2022

Chairperson