

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Environmental Sustainability Committee Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 21 September 2022, commencing at 9.00am.

Members Present: Councillors Brent Barrett (in the Chair), Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Aleisha Rutherford.

Non Members: Councillors Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM and Bruno Petrenas.

Apologies: The Mayor (Grant Smith) (early departure), Councillors Renee Dingwall (late arrival), Leonie Hapeta (late arrival), Billy Meehan (early departure), Aleisha Rutherford (early departure), and Mr Peter Te Rangi.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) entered the meeting at 9.09am during consideration of clause 19. He left the meeting at 9.54am at the conclusion of clause 20 and entered the meeting again at 11.22am during consideration of clause 24. He was not present for clauses 17, 18, and 21 to 23 inclusive.

Councillor Vaughan Dennison left the meeting at 9.15am during consideration of clause 19. He entered the meeting again at 9.31am during consideration of clause 20. He was not present for clause 19.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 9.53am at the conclusion of clause 20. She was not present for clauses 21 to 27 inclusive.

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed at 10.50am. He was not present for clauses 23 to 27 inclusive.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta entered the meeting at 11.05am during consideration of clause 23. She was not present for clauses 17 to 22 inclusive.

Councillor Rachel Bowen left the meeting at 11.08am during consideration of clause 23. She entered the meeting again at 11.45am during consideration of clause 25. She was not present for clauses 23 and 24.

17-22 Apologies

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The COMMITTEE RESOLVED

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 17-22 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE - PART I - 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Declaration of Interest

Councillor Karen Naylor declared an interest in Item 13: Process and resourcing required to establish a Food Resilience Policy (clause 26) but said she would consider the item with an open mind.

18-22 Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The COMMITTEE RESOLVED

1. That the minutes of the Environmental Sustainability Committee meeting of 18 May 2022 be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 18-22 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

19-22 Update on the Low Carbon Road Map

Memorandum, presented by Adam Jarvis, Senior Climate Change Advisor and David Watson, Climate Change Analyst.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) entered the meeting at 9.09am.
Councillor Vaughan Dennison left the meeting at 9.15am.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The COMMITTEE RESOLVED

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'PNCC Low Carbon Roadmap' and the attachment titled 'PNCC Low Carbon Road Map Workflow Diagram' for information.

Clause 19-22 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE - PART I - 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

20-22 National Emissions Reduction Plan Summary

Memorandum, presented by Adam Jarvis, Senior Climate Change Advisor and David Watson, Climate Change Analyst.

Councillor Vaughan Dennison entered the meeting again at 9.31am.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'National Emissions Reduction Plan Summary' and the attachments titled 'Summary Table of NERP Actions and Implications' and 'Affected Strategy Documents, Plans, and Funding Opportunities' for information.

Clause 20-22 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, Bruno Petrenas and Aleisha Rutherford.

Councillor Aleisha Rutherford left the meeting at 9.53am.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) left the meeting at 9.54am.

21-22 PNCC Organisational Emissions Inventory 2020/21

Memorandum, presented by Adam Jarvis, Senior Climate Change Advisor & David Watson, Climate Change Analyst.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note that the results of the PNCC Organisational Emissions Inventory 2020/21, excluding transmission and distribution losses, are:
 - PNCC emissions have fallen from 26,444 tCO₂e in 2015/16, to 19,297 tCO₂e in 2020/21, a 27% reduction.
 - Non-landfill related emissions fell from 6,834 tCO₂e to 5,374 tCO₂e over the same period, a 21.4% reduction overall, and a 5.9% reduction from the previous 2019/20 period.

Clause 21-22 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

22-22 PNCC Zero Carbon Feasibility Study

Memorandum, presented by Adam Jarvis, Senior Climate Change Advisor. The officer corrected an error in the report: The first paragraph

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE - PART I - 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

should read "... a 30% reduction in citywide emissions by **2031**" not 2021.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Orphée Mickalad.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Council receive the memorandum titled 'PNCC Zero Carbon Feasibility Study' and the attachment titled 'List of considered projects by scenario' for information.
2. That the Council use the information provided in the memorandum titled 'PNCC Zero Carbon Feasibility Study' to inform future direction setting, including but not limited to the formal adoption of a carbon neutrality target, the selection of a preferred emissions scenario, and resourcing to achieve that trajectory through the 2024-34 Long Term Plan.
3. That the Chief Executive conduct an options analysis for the emissions reduction scenarios, including accelerated versions of Scenarios 2 and 3, in time for Council to identify a preferred scenario to consult on during the 2024-34 Long Term Plan process.

Clause 22-22 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

The meeting adjourned at 10.34am.

The meeting resumed at 10.50am.

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed.

23-22

Low Carbon Fund - 2021/22 Update

Memorandum, presented by Adam Jarvis, Senior Climate Change Advisor.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta entered the meeting at 11:05am.

Councillor Rachel Bowen left the meeting at 11:08am.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee note that collectively the projects delivered through the Low Carbon Fund during the 2021/22 financial year are estimated to save 102.71 tCO₂e per year and have a net present value of \$1,100,872 compared to a total capital cost of \$711,781.

Clause 23-22 above was carried 10 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE - PART I - 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

For:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

Abstained:

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

24-22

Response to New Zealand Green Building Council Recommendations

Memorandum, presented by Jono Ferguson-Pye, City Planning Manager and David Watson, Climate Change Analyst.

Officers corrected two errors in the report in the Next Steps section (page 129 of the agenda):

Paragraph 1 should read 'recommendation 1 or 5 (**reduced consent fees and reduced DC fees**) a further..

Paragraph 3 – should read 'recommendation 2 or **4** (greater density for homes and **increased consenting support**) a further..

The Mayor (Grant Smith) entered the meeting again at 11:22am.

The Chair moved three additional motions (resolutions 2-4 below) to add eco- building certifications onto LIM reports and to direct officers to further investigate Recommendations 1 and 5 in the report.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'Response to New Zealand Green Building Council Recommendations' for information.
2. That the Chief Executive include Homestar, Greenstar or similar certifications on LIM reports, unless an unforeseen legal barrier or legal risk is identified when implementing this direction.
3. That the Chief Executive report back to Council if any unforeseen legal barrier or legal risk is identified as part of the process of including Homestar, Greenstar or similar certifications on LIM reports.
4. That the Chief Executive provide further analysis on Recommendation 1 (Reduced fees for consenting buildings that are certified as lower carbon) and Recommendation 5 (Reduced development contributions for sustainable buildings or homes) to support decision-making on those options.

Clause 24-22 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE - PART I - 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

25-22 Progress Towards Actions in the Waste Management and Minimisation Plan 2019

Memorandum, presented by Bryce Hosking, Acting Group Manager - Resource Recovery, and Natasha Hickmott, Activities Manager - Resource Recovery.

Councillor Rachel Bowen entered the meeting again at 11:45am.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'Progress Towards Actions in the Waste Management and Minimisation Plan 2019' for information.

Clause 25-22 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

26-22 Process and resourcing required to establish a Food Resilience Policy

Memorandum, presented by Julie Macdonald, Strategy and Policy Manager.

Councillor Johnson moved an additional motion to include the development of a Food Resilience Policy into the draft Annual Budget 2023/24 so the concept of a policy could be publicly consulted on.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Patrick Handcock ONZM.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'Process and resourcing required to establish a Food Resilience Policy' for information.
2. That investment of \$20,000 for development of a Food Resilience Policy be referred to the Annual Budget 2023/24 budget process for consideration.

Clause 26-22 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE - PART I - 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

Bruno Petrenas.

27-22 Committee Work Schedule - September 2022

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Zulfiqar Butt.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive its Work Schedule dated September 2022.

Clause 27-22 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Susan Baty, Rachel Bowen, Zulfiqar Butt, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Bruno Petrenas.

The meeting finished at 12.09pm

Confirmed

Chairperson

Chief Executive