

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Council Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on:

**Tuesday 16 May 2023 – 9.00am
Wednesday 17 May 2023 – 9.00am, 1.00pm and 5.30pm**

The meeting commenced at 9.00am.

Members Present: The Mayor Grant Smith (Chair), Deputy Mayor Debi Marshall-Lobb, and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay QSM, Patrick Handcock ONZM, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Apologies: Councillors Roly Fitzgerald and Vaughan Dennison.

Councillor Patrick Handcock left the meeting at 9.20am Tuesday 16 May 2023 consideration of clause 73. He entered the meeting again at 9.21am after consideration of clause 73. He was not present for clause 73.

Councillor Vaughan Dennison entered the meeting when it resumed at 9.01am Wednesday 17 May 2023 for session 2. He was not present when the meeting resumed at 6.37pm during session 4.

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald entered the meeting when it resumed at 9.01am Wednesday 17 May 2023 for session 2. He was not present when the meeting resumed at 5.31pm for session 4.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) was not present when the meeting resumed at 9.01am Wednesday 17 May 2023 for session 2. He entered the meeting again at 9.41am during session 2. He left the meeting again at 2.14pm during session 3. He was not present for session 4.

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed at 5.31pm Wednesday 17 May 2023 for session 4. He entered the meeting again at 5.42pm.

Councillors Rachel Bowen and Lew Findlay were not present when the meeting resumed at 5.31pm Wednesday 17 May 2023 for session 4.

Karakia Timatanga

Deputy Mayor Debi Marshall-Lobb opened the meeting with karakia.

70-23 Apologies: Session 1 – 9.00am, 16 May 2023

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council resolves to receive the apologies from Councillors Roly Fitzgerald and Vaughan Dennison.

Clause 70-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

71-23

Late Item / Notification of Additional Item

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the late item for the following reasons:

Remit to Local Government New Zealand 2023 Annual General Meeting

Reason for lateness:

The remit was received after the Agenda was published.

Reason for urgency:

Hamilton City Council have requested a response by Friday 19 May 2023.

Clause 71-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

72-23

Petition: Excessive use of Motorbikes on Mangaone Stream Walkway

Ian Duncan and Pauline Duncan, residents in Westbrook, presented a petition (signed by 67 residents) seeking Council assistance with excessive use of motorbikes on Mangaone Stream Walkway.

The following additional comments were made:

- Reconstructed turnstiles to be made with a sturdier material.
- Unable to resolve through numerous communication with Police.
- Noted recent incident of Police being injured down Maxwells Line and historic fatality of a child on the walkway.
- Witnessed unrestrained child passengers.

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the petition for information.

Clause 72-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

73-23

Confirmation of Minutes

Councillor Patrick Handcock left the meeting at 9.20am.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council resolves the minutes of the Council meeting of 3 May 2023 Part I Public and Part II Confidential, be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 73-23 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Councillor Patrick Handcock entered the meeting again at 9.21am.

74-23

Appointment of Chairs for following sessions

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Patrick Handcock.

RESOLVED

1. That the Chairs for the remaining sessions be agreed as follows:

Wednesday 17 May 2023, 9.00am to 11.00am:
Deputy Mayor Debi Marshall-Lobb

Wednesday 17 May 2023, 1.00pm to 3.00pm:
Councillor Orphée Mickalad

Wednesday 17 May 2023, 5.30pm to 7.30pm:
Councillor Kaydee Zabelin

Clause 74-23 above was carried 13 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Abstained:

Councillor Orphée Mickalad.

75-23 Extension of meeting time

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council resolves as per Standing Order 2.1.7 that the meeting be extended until 8.00pm on Wednesday 17 May 2023.

Clause 75-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

76-23 Hearing of Submissions: Draft Annual Budget 2023/24 - Session 1, 9.00am, 16 May 2023

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the submissions on the draft Annual Budget 2023/24 and hear from presenters who wish to be heard in support of their submission.
2. That Council note the Procedure for Hearing of Submissions, as described in the procedure sheet.

Clause 76-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Council considered submissions on the Draft Annual Budget 2023/24 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before Council and made oral

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members.

Environment Network Manawatū (ENM) (45)

Helen King, Madz BatchEl and Dave Mollard (MFAN) spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- Current location is at capacity to facilitate current activities.
- Different activities are scattered at different venues whereas encompassing them all in one location will make this more visible to the public.

Manawatū Food Action Network (MFAN) (44)

Dave Mollard, Helen King and Madz BatchEl spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- A recent hui held had approximately 70 people in attendance giving an example of community involvement.
- Advocated for communities to lead their own community.
- Wanted to see the city's resources unlocked to be used to counter food insecurity.

Swimming Manawatū (57)

Sarah Laurence (Chair) spoke to her submission and made the following additional comments:

- Highlighted difference between swimming as a recreation and as a sport. Competitive swimming requires one of two pool layouts, essentially a pool length of 25 or 50 meter pools.
- Referenced the Manawatu and Whanganui Region Sport Facilities plan, and hoped this report would be updated as a result of the needs assessment project underway.
- Insufficient aquatic facilities to cater for entire community's needs currently; hindered community growth and progression of the sport.
- Current facilities not fit for current era - measurements outdated; limited access by users and not available all year round.
- Noted the safety recommendation for elite swimmers per lanes of 2-3 approximately; currently at 8 approximately around peak times.
- Challenged Council to audit the success of the investment in the budget in regards to the arrangement with Community Leisure Management (CLM). Assess how this best serves the community independent of CLMs own survey.
- Highlighted Hawkes Bay facilities as a model of positive investment outcome.
- Not satisfied that covering the Lido outdoor pool is an

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

appropriate fix in the long term.

Ryan (59)

Ryan spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- Overcrowding when trying to train, often navigating through the lane with other users.
- Current pools restricted for competitions to a few times throughout the year; restrictive in depth and quality is under par.

Te Pū Harakeke – Community Collective Manawatū (98)

Tim Kendrew (Manager) and Justin Ngai (Programme Coordinator) spoke to their submission and made the following additional comments:

- Families commonly prioritising housing costs over food.
- Sector is understaffed of qualified professionals.
- Encouraged Council to look through the wellbeing lens when making decisions.

Community Leisure Management Limited (77)

Lynden Noakes (Lido Facility Manager) and Bridget Cairns (Palmerston North General Manager) spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

Bunnythorpe Community (81)

Flo Gibson and Jo Jamieson (Chair) spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

Further information (photos and additional written information) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

Te Araroa Manawatū Trust (47)

David Grant (Chair) and Brian Way spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

Further information (PowerPoint presentation) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

Karakia Whakamutunga

Deputy Mayor Debi Marshall-Lobb closed Session 1 with karakia.

The meeting adjourned (Session 1 finished) at 10.56am.

The meeting resumed (Session 2 started) at 9.01am Wednesday 17 May 2023.

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

Councillors Vaughan Dennison and Roly Fitzgerald entered the meeting when it resumed at 9.01am.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) was not present when the meeting resumed at 9.01am.

Karakia Timatanga

Councillor Kaydee Zabelin opened Session 2 with karakia.

77-23 Apologies: Session 2 – 9.00am, 17 May 2023

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock.

RESOLVED

1. That Council resolves to receive the apology for late arrival from The Mayor, Grant Smith.

Clause 77-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Hearing of Submissions: Draft Annual Budget 2023/24 - Session 2, 9.00am, 17 May 2023

The Council considered submissions on the Draft Annual Budget 2023/24 with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Council and made oral statements in support of their submission and replied to questions from Elected Members.

Age Friendly Palmerston North (49)

Marian Dean spoke to her submission and made no additional comments.

St Matthews Anglican Church (78) and River Stop Awapuni (76)

David Chapple and Bev Page spoke to two submissions simultaneously and made the following additional comments.

- Cycleway appears unfinished and requested Council to include this as an area to slow traffic.

Further information (photos) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

Pathway Presbyterian Church (46)

Judy Seccomb and Roy Tankersley spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) entered the meeting again at 9.41am.

Manawatu Tenants Union (39)

Cameron Jenkins (Coordinator) spoke to the submission and made the following additional comment:

- There is an over-representation of non-tenant renters such as boarders renting a room.

Athena Women's Collective (92)

Jean Hera, Maryanne Mechen and Kerry Hocquard spoke to their submission and made the following additional comment:

- Need to have a more streamlined process to access facilities and funding for small community projects for those who do not want to work under an umbrella association or form an association of their own.

Whatunga Tuao Volunteer Central (21)

Kate Aplin spoke to her submission and made no additional comments.

Peter and Isobel Wilson (28)

Peter and Isobel Wilson spoke to their submission and made no additional comments.

Further written information was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

78-23

Remit to Local Government New Zealand 2023 Annual General Meeting
Memorandum, presented by Hannah White, Democracy & Governance Manager.

Elected Members agreed to endorse all three remit proposals.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Grant Smith.

RESOLVED

1. That Council endorse the 2023 remit proposal on Virtual Quorum from Hamilton City Council (Attachment 1).

Clause 78.1-23 above was carried 12 votes to 3, with 1 abstention, the voting

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Lew Findlay, Billy Meehan and William Wood.

Abstained:

Councillor Vaughan Dennison.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Grant Smith.

2. That Council endorse the 2023 remit proposal on Kiwisaver for Elected Members from Hamilton City Council (Attachment 2).

Clause 78.2-23 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Grant Smith.

3. That Council endorse the 2023 remit proposal on the development of a shared understanding and centralised framework of wellbeing from Hamilton City Council (Attachment 3).

Clause 78.3-23 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned (Session 2 finished) at 11.03am.

The meeting resumed (Session 3 started) at 1.01pm.

79-23

Apologies: Session 3 – 1.00pm, 17 May 2023

Moved Patrick Handcock, seconded Brent Barrett.

RESOLVED

1. That Council resolves to receive the apologies for an early departure from The Mayor, Grant Smith (Council business).

Clause 79-23 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Hearing of Submissions: Draft Annual Budget 2023/24 - Session 3, 1.00pm, 17 May 2023

The Committee considered submissions on the draft Annual Budget 2023-24 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Council and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members.

Awapuni Community Centre (56)

Allan Burne spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- Asked for further consideration for security alarms.
- The centre is used regularly and needs to be maintained to a standard considerate of current and future demands with better mobility scooter access for himself and all users.

John Bent (75)

John Bent spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- Explained 'nice-to-haves' as rate payer responsibilities versus tax payer responsibilities.
- That the function and focus of Council should include preparation for the 'inevitable'.

Nui Community – Papaioea Pasifika Community Trust (103)

Sunlou Liuvaie (Chair) and Annie Scoon (Operations Manager) spoke to their submission and made no additional comment.

Pasifika Reference Group (101)

Courtney Manu (Co-Chair) spoke to her submission and made the following additional comments:

- The need to develop the Pacifica Centre now is integral to the success of the Pacific community.
- To have a focus on youth and their aspirations outside of education.
- Would like to explore partnership with Council and/or other

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

partners, for housing and housing needs for Pacifica; housing needs to be affordable with consideration to include 'Talano' protocols.

- Long term goal to see Pacifica people living in varied locations across the city.
- Underrepresented in statistics where decisions are made regarding public housing.

Hugh Wilde (61)

Hugh Wilde spoke to his submission and made no further additional comment.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) left the meeting again at 2.14pm.

Federated Farmers New Zealand (74)

Peter Matich (Policy Manager) and Murray Holdaway (former Provincial President Manawatu/Rangitikei) spoke to their submission and made the following additional comment:

- Consideration of Rural Rating Differential.

Ross Linklater (97)

Ross Linklater spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments.

- Safety for cyclists is a main concern.
- To consider more hitching rails for bikes in the inner city.

Further information (map) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

The meeting adjourned (Session 3 finished) at 2.48pm.
The meeting resumed (Session 4 started) at 5.31pm.

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald and Billy Meehan were not present when the meeting resumed at 5.31pm.

80-23

Apologies: Session 4 – 5.30pm, 17 May 2023

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded William Wood.

RESOLVED

1. That Council resolves to receive the apologies from The Mayor Grant Smith and Councillors Lew Findlay and Rachel Bowen (on Council Business); and lateness for Councillors Roly Fitzgerald and Billy Meehan. Early departure for Councillor Dennison.

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

Clause 80-23 above was carried 11 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Hearing of Submissions: Draft Annual Budget 2023/24 - Session 4, 5.30pm, 17 May 2023

The Committee considered submissions on the Draft Annual Budget 2023-24 together with supporting oral statements including additional tabled material.

The following persons appeared before the Council and made oral statements in support of their submissions and replied to questions from Elected Members.

Big Street Bikers (89)

Cleve Cameron spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- Proposal for a 10yr term.
- Maintenance of the project would require hiring someone locally.

Further information (PowerPoint presentation) was tabled at the meeting for circulation to Elected Members.

Councillor Billy Meehan entered the meeting again at 5.42pm.

Paul Smillie (110)

Paul Smillie spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- For Council to look to align with other Councils in New Zealand.
- To use a rating system that measures the market value as close as can be.

Venessa Pokaia (105) and Cushla Kerr (106)

Venessa Pokaia and Cushla Kerr spoke to their submissions simultaneously and made the following additional comments:

- One of the values of a cultural hub is to provide a safe place for all hours; a place of refuge.
- Different tikanga with Opie Reserve proposals.
- Proposed location will be better suited to all in comparison to

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

other facilities.

Ice Breaker Aquatics (31)

Jeff Cruickshank spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- Emphasised the critical need for a new aquatics facility.
- Noted media reports 30% of submissions to this draft agenda are around aquatics.
- Aquatics facilities are not just for swimming; many other sports use aquatics facilities.
- Current club trains at Boys High pool which is near capacity.
- Lack of engagement in community to promote the sport.
- Current facilities are outdated making it challenging to deliver high quality experiences residents need and deserve.
- Covering the Lido outdoor pool is not a sustainable solution or long term financially viable option.
- Proposal of a new multi-purpose 50 metre by 10 lane pool better value for money and will safeguard the future needs of the community.

The meeting adjourned at 6.30pm.
The meeting resumed at 6.37pm.

Councillor Vaughan Dennison was not present when the meeting resumed at 6.37pm.

Viva Café and Bar (66)

Deniz Gultekin spoke to his submission and made the following additional comment:

- Requests bike racks and seats down Cuba Street to bring people to the area. Approximately 15 bike racks would suffice with seating.

Mike Moleta (104)

Mike Moleta spoke to his submission and made the following additional comments:

- He is a parent of two children who play water sports.
- Requested Council to continue the quest for a multi-use indoor 50 meter pool with depth.
- No locally suitable facilities for water-polo.
- Water sports training is restricted due to space.
- Competitive water sports players cannot properly train for national meets locally.
- The lack of proper training facilities restricts uptake into aquatic

COUNCIL - PART I - 16 MAY 2023

sports.

- It is hard as a parent to attend his children's sport games due to time and cost for travel to competitions and training.
- There is disadvantage for the area not being able to attract nationally held sports events.

Karakia Whakamutunga

Deputy Mayor Debi Marshall-Lobb closed the meeting with karakia.

The meeting closed at 6.55pm Wednesday 17 May 2023

Confirmed 31 May 2023

Mayor