

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Extraordinary Economic Growth Committee Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 09 October 2023, commencing at 10am.

Members Present: Councillors Leonie Hapeta (in the Chair), William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

Non Members: Councillors Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Apologies: Councillor Orphée Mickalad (early departure)

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb entered the meeting at 2.43pm during consideration of clause 49-23. She was not present for clauses 38-23 to 48-23 inclusive.

Councillor Orphée Mickalad left the meeting at 3.35pm after consideration of clause 50-23. He was not present for clauses 51-23 to 52-23 inclusive.

Karakia Timatanga

Councillor Kaydee Zabelin opened the meeting with karakia

38-23 Apologies

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 38-23 above was carried 9 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Note: Councillor Bowen's vote was not recorded due to technical difficulties

39-23 Objections Received - Bus Shelters 2023

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee hear objections from presenters who indicated

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

their wish to be heard in support of their objection.

2. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Objections (Attachment 1).

Clause 39-23 above was carried 10 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

40-23

Transport Choices, Bus Stops - Summary of Submissions for Bus Shelters

Memorandum, presented by Sue Kelly, Manager Project Management Office, Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'Transport Choices, Bus Stops – Summary of Submissions for Bus Shelters,' presented to the Economic Growth Committee on 9 October 2023.

Clause 40-23 above was carried 10 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

41-23

Proposed Bus Shelter: 201 John F Kennedy Drive

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

Representatives from Turners Cars spoke to their objection but made no additional comments.

Moved William Wood, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 41-23 above was carried 9 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

Councillors William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orophée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

42-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 128 Pacific Drive

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The resident spoke to their objection but made no additional comments.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 42-23 above was carried 6 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lorna Johnson, Orophée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

Against:

Councillors William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison and Kaydee Zabelin.

43-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 742 Pioneer Highway

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The Property Manager of Pioneer Bakery spoke to their client's objection but made no additional comments.

The Committee lay the report on the table, to give officers time to consider alternative sites for either the bus stop or the loading zone.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

That the Committee lie the report on the table until the Committee meeting on 25 October 2023.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

Clause 43-23 above was carried 8 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett and Vaughan Dennison.

44-23

Proposed Bus Shelter: 739 Tremaine Avenue

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The Operations Manager of Advantage Tyre Solutions spoke to the objection but made no additional comments.

Officers agreed to work with the Operations Manager to make sure the bus shelter does not obstruct the business' sign.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 44-23 above was carried 9 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillor Mark Arnott.

45-23

Proposed Bus Shelter: 278 Featherston Street

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

This objection was taken on the papers.

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Patrick Handcock.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 45-23 above was carried 9 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

46-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 82 Te Awe Awe Street

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager.

This objection was taken on the papers.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 46-23 above was carried 10 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

47-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 593 Ferguson Street

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport and James Miguel, Senior Transport Planner.

This objection was taken on the papers.

Moved Patrick Handcock, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 47-23 above was carried 10 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 12.45 pm.

The meeting returned 2.00 pm.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

48-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 550 Ruahine Street

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The residents spoke to their objection and made the following additional comments.

- The resident queried what the purpose of the LED lights on the bus shelter were for – how can they discourage vandalism if they are switched off after the last bus of the night?.
- Why had the council officers not considered placing the bus shelter 100 metre up the road outside the school field?.

Councillor Wood took the Chair 2.18pm

Councillor Hapeta returned to the Chair 2.21pm

The Committee considered that there were more appropriate locations in the area for a bus shelter. They asked that officers review the alternative location (outside the school field) 100m up the road.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council decide not to proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Clause 48-23 above was carried 6 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

49-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 296 Ruahine Street

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The resident spoke to their objection and made the following additional comments.

- The proposed bus shelter would cause a loss of privacy, as the bedrooms are at the front of the house.
- A condition of the resource consent for a sub-division of the property restricts the height of the fence.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb entered the meeting at 2:43pm

The Committee considered that because of the potential loss of privacy, this site was not suitable for a bus shelter.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council not proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Clause 49-23 above was carried 8 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

50-23

Proposed Bus Shelter: 64 Clarke Avenue

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The resident spoke to their objection but made no additional comments.

The Committee considered that because of the potential loss of privacy, and the potential road safety issues of having a bus stopping on a bend in the road this site was not suitable for a bus shelter.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council not proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Clause 50-23 above was carried 11 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb, Orphée Mickalad, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 3.35pm.

The meeting resumed at 3.50pm.

Councillor Orphée Mickalad was not present when the meeting resumed at 3.50pm.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

51-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 48 Holdsworth Avenue

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

The resident spoke to their objection and made the following additional comment.

- The proposed bus shelter would cause a loss of privacy, as a bedroom and living room are at the front of the house and there is no fence.
- There are more suitable properties with fences on the same street.

The Committee considered that because of the potential loss of privacy, this site was not suitable for a bus shelter.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council decide not to proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Clause 51-23 above was carried 8 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Rachel Bowen and Patrick Handcock.

52-23 Proposed Bus Shelter: 61 Albert Street

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Michael Bridge, Activity Manager – Active Transport.

Objection taken on the papers.

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 52-23 above was carried 8 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors William Wood, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb, Patrick Handcock and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta and Mark Arnott.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
09 OCTOBER 2023

Karakia Whakamutunga

Councillor Kaydee Zabelin closed the meeting with a karakia.

The meeting finished at 4.27pm

Confirmed 25 October 2023

Chair