

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Council Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 01 November 2023, commencing at 9.04am

Members Present: Grant Smith (The Mayor) (in the Chair) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Apologies: Councillor Vaughan Dennison (on Council Business).

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed at 1.20pm. He entered the meeting again at 1.24pm during consideration of clause 179. He was not present for clause 178.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta left the meeting at 1.38pm during consideration of clause 180. She entered the meeting again at 1.41pm during consideration of clause 181. She was not present for clause 180.

Karakia Timatanga

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald opened the meeting with karakia.

171-23 Apologies

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the apologies.

Clause 171-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

172-23 **Presentation - Students Against Cuts**

Joshua Parsons and Matt Russell, Massey University students and members of Students Against Cuts, presented their concerns about the proposals at Massey University and their impact on the students and broader community.

The presenters stated that:

- The cuts undertaken by Massey University were the largest in the tertiary sector. Massey's capacity for science, teaching and research had diminished significantly.

- Students protests were organised in response to a lack of transparency and proper engagement with affected parties.

- Students Against Cuts was seeking a pause in the restructure process and the return of funding to the tertiary education sector; as well as access to Massey University financial information. They requested a meeting between the Ministry of Education/Tertiary Education Commission, University Management, community stakeholders such as the Council, business and community organisations of Palmerston North, and students and staff.

- Students Against Cuts requested support from Council to build back better aiming for a university that is really tight in the city, including the following specific requests:

- (i) appeal to the Tertiary Education Commission and University Council, on behalf of Palmerston North;

- (ii) support a Palmy 'Save Massey' Hui with venue, networks and publicity;

- (iii) make submissions on behalf of Palmerston North during Massey's consultations; and

- (iv) support their call for a broader and more inclusive approach with discussions involving all stakeholders.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That the Council receive the presentation for information.

Clause 172-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

173-23 Additional Items

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

To receive rectified recommendations from Part I Public Economic Growth Committee Extraordinary meeting dated 9 October 2023, incorporating the following further two recommendations:

- Proposed Bus Shelter: 739 Tremain Avenue (**clause 44-23**)
- Proposed Bus Shelter: 82 Te Awe Awe Street (**clause 46-23**)

Reason for lateness: administrative error.

Reason for urgency: so that the project can progress in a timely manner.

Clause 173-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

174-23 Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That the minutes of the ordinary meeting of 4 October 2023 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 174.1-23 above was carried 13 votes to 0, with 2 abstentions, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Abstained:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta and Billy Meehan.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

2. That the minutes of the extraordinary meeting of 25 October 2023 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Clause 174.2-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Abstained:

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald.

REPORTS

175-23 Proposed Bus Shelter - 742 Pioneer Highway

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager and Bryce Hosking, Acting Group Manager - Transport and Development.

The mover of resolution 2 expressed that a better solution for placing the bus shelter could be found, taking into consideration interests from all stakeholders including the business community.

On the same line, the mover of resolution 3 also mentioned that the engagement process could be improved.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council lift the report Proposed Bus Shelter - 742 Pioneer Highway off the table.

Clause 175.1-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 10.09am.

The meeting resumed at 10.25am.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Mark Arnott.

RESOLVED

2. That Council uphold the objection and decide not to proceed with

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

the proposal for a bus shelter at this location.

Clause 175.2-23 above was carried 10 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson and Karen Naylor.

Moved Mark Arnott, seconded William Wood.

RESOLVED

3. That the Chief Executive consider an alternative location for the bus shelter and stop in the vicinity of the shopping centre.

Clause 175.3-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Abstained:

Councillor Lorna Johnson.

176-23 Bunnythorpe Infrastructure Update

Memorandum, presented by Bryce Hosking, Acting Group Manager - Transport and Development, Mike Monaghan, Group Manager - Three Waters.

Additional motion 2 was passed to guarantee transparency during the decision making process and, should those budgets be supported, assure funding is allocated to specific projects in Bunnythorpe.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the memorandum titled 'Bunnythorpe Infrastructure Update' presented to Council on 1 November 2023.

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock.

2. That the budget line(s) to resource the Bunnythorpe improvements signalled in this report be tagged as Bunnythorpe specific for the Long Term Plan 2024-34 process.

Clause 176-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

177-23 Road Maintenance Contract Six Monthly Update

Memorandum, presented by Bryce Hosking, Acting Group Manager - Transport and Development.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the memorandum titled 'Road Maintenance Contract Six Monthly Update' presented on 1 November 2023.
2. That Council increase the budget in the capital renewal Programme 74 (City-wide – Street Light Renewals) by \$350,000 to enable the outstanding 300 luminary replacements to be addressed in 2023/24.

Clause 177-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded William Wood.

Note:

On a motion to amend resolution 2 above to add: '... subject to Waka Kotahi co-funding being available by January 2024', the motion was lost 3 votes to 12, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Orphée Mickalad and Karen Naylor.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Johnson, Billy Meehan, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 12.20pm.

The meeting resumed at 1.20pm.

Councillor Billy Meehan was not present when the meeting resumed.

178-23 Streets for People 6 Monthly Update

Memorandum, presented by Bryce Hosking, Acting Group Manager - Transport and Development.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the memorandum titled 'Streets for People Six Monthly Update' presented on 1 November 2023.

Clause 178-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

179-23 6-monthly report on International Relations and Education Activities

Memorandum, presented by Gabrielle Loga, International Relations Manager.

Councillor Billy Meehan entered the meeting again at 1.24pm.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council note the progress on the International Relations and Education activities over the past six months, contributing to the Economic Development Plan and Innovative and Growing City Strategy.

Clause 179-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

180-23 Wastewater Treatment Plant Discharge Consent Project - Nature Calls Steering Group - Terms of Reference

Memorandum, presented by Mike Monaghan, Group Manager 3 Waters, and Anna Lewis, Project Manager - Wastewater Discharge Consent Programme.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta left the meeting at 1.38pm.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council endorse the draft Terms of Reference for the Nature Calls Steering Group (Attachment 1).
2. That Council agree the Mayor's recommendation to appoint The Mayor, Cr Brent Barrett, Cr Vaughan Dennison and Cr Kaydee Zabelin as Elected Member representatives on the Steering Group.

Clause 180-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

181-23 Definition and application of interests and conflicts of interest

Memorandum, presented by Desiree Harvey, Legal Counsel Waid Crockett, Chief Executive.

Councillor Leonie Hapeta entered the meeting again at 1.41pm.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the memorandum titled 'Definition and application of interests and conflicts of interest for consideration' presented to Council on 1 November 2023.

Clause 181-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

182-23 Annual Meeting Calendar 2024

Memorandum, presented by Hannah White, Democracy & Governance Manager.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That Council adopt the Annual Meeting Calendar 2024 (Attachment 1).

Clause 182-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

183-23 Council Work Schedule

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

1. That the Council receive its Work Schedule dated November 2023.

Clause 183-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

RECOMMENDATIONS FROM COMMITTEE MEETINGS

184-23 Economic Growth Committee Part I Public - 9 October 2023 and Part I Public - 25 October 2023

Consideration was given to Economic Growth Committee recommendations as stated below.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

RESOLVED

1. That the recommendations from the Economic Growth Committee meeting of 9 October 2023, including the tabled additional items (clauses 41, 42 and 44 to 52-23), be adopted:

Proposed Bus Shelter: 201 John F Kennedy Drive (clause 41-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 128 Pacific Drive (clause 42-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 739 Tremaine Avenue (clause 44-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 593 Ferguson Street, Terrace End (clause 45-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 82 Te Awe Awe Street (clause 46-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 278 Featherston Street (clause 47-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 550 Ruahine Street (clause 48-23)

That the Council decide not to proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 296 Ruahine Street (clause 49-23)

That the Council does not proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 64 Clarke Avenue (clause 50-23)

That the Council does not proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

Proposed Bus Shelter: 48 Holdsworth Avenue (clause 51-23)

That the Council decide not to proceed with the proposal for a bus shelter.

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Proposed Bus Shelter: 61 Albert Street (clause 52-23)

That the Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 184.1-23 above was carried 14 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Abstained:

Councillor Billy Meehan.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

RESOLVED

2. That the recommendation from the Economic Growth Committee meeting of 25 October 2023 be adopted:

Palmerston North Airport Limited - Annual report for 12 months ended 30 June 2023 (clause 59-23)

2. That Council increase the total remuneration for directors of Palmerston North Airport Limited from \$135,000 per annum to 146,000 per annum.

Clause 184.2-23 above was carried 11 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

Against:

Councillors Brent Barrett, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

185-23

Rangitāne o Manawatū Committee Part I Public - 18 October 2023

Consideration was given to Rangitāne o Manawatū Committee recommendations as stated below.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

That recommendations from the Rangitāne o Manawatū Committee meeting of 18 October 2023 be adopted:

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

Rangitāne o Manawatū Environmental Management Plan (clause 8-23)

1. That Council hold the Rangitāne o Manawatū Environmental Management Plan as a Council record under section 35A(b) of the Resource Management Act 1991.
2. That Council use the Rangitāne o Manawatū Environmental Management Plan to inform future planning and decision-making, as directed by the Resource Management Act 1991, Spatial Planning Act 2023 and Natural and Built Environment Act 2023.
3. That Council use the Rangitāne o Manawatū Environmental Management Plan to inform the review of direction setting documents such as the Long-Term Plan and Council's supporting strategies, plans, policies, bylaws, master plans and frameworks.

Clause 185-23 above was carried 13 votes to 0, with 2 abstentions, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

Abstained:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta and William Wood.

EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC

186-23 Recommendation to Exclude Public

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

RESOLVED

That the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting listed in the table below.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under Section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General subject of each matter to be considered		Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter	Ground(s) under Section 48(1) for passing this resolution
22.	Minutes of the ordinary meeting - Part II Confidential - 4 October 2023	For the reasons set out in the ordinary minutes of 4 October 2023, held in public present.	
23.	Update on Progress of	THIRD PARTY	s7(2)(b)(ii), s7(2)(h)

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

	Investment Options for Palmerston North Airport Limited	COMMERCIAL: Disclosing the information could harm a company's commercial position, COMMERCIAL ACTIVITIES: This information needs to be kept confidential to allow Council to engage in commercial activities without prejudice or disadvantage and NEGOTIATIONS: This information needs to be kept confidential to ensure that Council can negotiate effectively, especially in business dealings	and s7(2)(i)
24.	Trustee Appointments to The Regent Theatre Trust Board and Palmerston North Performing Arts Trust	PRIVACY: This information needs to be kept private to protect personal information that is confidential or sensitive. This includes people who are no longer alive	s7(2)(a)
25.	District Licensing Committee Appointments	PRIVACY: This information needs to be kept private to protect personal information that is confidential or sensitive. This includes people who are no longer alive	s7(2)(a)
26.	Minutes of the ordinary meeting - Part IIB Confidential (Elected Members only) - 4 October 2023	For the reasons set out in the ordinary minutes of 4 October 2023, held in public present.	

COUNCIL - PART I - 01 NOVEMBER 2023

27.	Part IIB: Chief Executive's Performance Review [Limited circulation]	PRIVACY: This information needs to be kept private to protect personal information that is confidential or sensitive. This includes people who are no longer alive	s7(2)(a)
-----	--	--	----------

This resolution is made in reliance on Section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by Section 6 or Section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public as stated in the above table.

Clause 186-23 above was carried 15 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

The public part of the meeting finished at 2.23pm

Confirmed 6 December 2023

Mayor