

PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

Minutes of the Extraordinary Economic Growth Committee Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 15 February 2024, commencing at 9.05am

Members Present: Councillor William Wood (in the Chair), The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

Non Members: Councillor Patrick Handcock.

Apologies: Councillors Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Brent Barrett (early departure), Debi Marshall-Lobb (late arrival and early departure)

Councillor Vaughan Dennison entered the meeting at 9.21am during consideration of clause 3. He was not present for clauses 1 and 2 inclusive.

Councillor Pat Handcock left the meeting at 9.49am during consideration of clause 4. He entered the meeting again when it resumed at 11.36am. He was not present for clauses 4 to 6 inclusive.

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb entered the meeting at 9.55am during consideration of clause 4. She left the meeting at 11.57am. She was not present for clauses 1 to 3 inclusive and 8 to 12 inclusive.

Councillor Brent Barrett left the meeting at 10.10am during consideration of clause 64. He entered the meeting again when it resumed at 2.02pm. He was not present for clauses 4 to 10 inclusive.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) left the meeting at 10.28am after consideration of clause 4. He entered the meeting again when it resumed at 11.36am. He was not present for clauses 5 and 6 inclusive.

Karakia Timatanga

Councillor William Wood opened the meeting with karakia.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

1-24 Apologies

Moved William Wood, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the apologies.

Clause 1-24 above was carried 9 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

2-24 Objections Received - Bus Shelters 2024

Moved William Wood, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee hear objections from presenters who indicated their wish to be heard in support of their objection.
2. That the Committee note the Procedure for Hearing of Objections (Attachment 1).

Clause 2-24 above was carried 9 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

3-24 Transport Choices, Bus Stops - Summary of Submissions for Bus Shelters

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport

Councillor Vaughan Dennison entered the meeting at 9.21am

Moved William Wood, seconded Grant Smith.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. That the Committee receive the memorandum titled 'Transport Choices, Bus Stops – Summary of Submissions for Bus Shelters' presented to the Economic Growth Committee on 15 February 2024.

Clause 3-24 above was carried 10 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

4-24 Proposed Bus Shelter: 92 Pacific Drive, Fitzherbert

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport.

Councillor Pat Handcock left the at 9.49am
Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb entered at 9.55am
Councillor Brent Barrett left the meeting at 10.10am

The residents spoke to their objection and presented a PowerPoint with additional photos.

The residents were concerned with the loss of privacy to the front bedroom if a bus shelter was installed. They emphasised the right to privacy is a human right and the privacy of their child is protected under the UN convention on the rights of the child.

The Committee resolved to move the shelter further to the east boundary of the property to alleviate the privacy concerns with the proposed shelter being in close proximity to the front bedroom windows.

Motion 1 was initially lost, and a subsequent motion (Motion 2) to uphold the objection was also lost. In order to give officers direction, 75% of the Committee present (6 members) agreed to take Motion 1 again under Standing Order 2.24.3 Revocation or alteration of resolution at same meeting .

Motion 1 was subsequently carried as clause 4.2-24.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. Under SO2.24.3 Revocation or alteration of resolution at same meeting, Councillors, Wood, Arnott, Dennison, Johnson, Mayor Smith, and Deputy Mayor Marshall-Lobb agree to take motion 1 again.

Clause 4.1-24 above was carried 9 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

2. That Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop with a modification to move further to the east side of the property boundary.

Clause 4.2-24 above was carried 9 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

Moved William Wood, seconded Mark Arnott.

Note:

Motion 1: That Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop with a modification to move further to the east side of the property boundary. The motion was tied 4 votes to 4, with 1 abstention. The chairperson declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors William Wood, Mark Arnott and Lorna Johnson.

Against:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Vaughan Dennison, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

Abstained:

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb.

Moved Billy Meehan, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

Note:

Motion 2: That Council uphold the objection. That Council notify 94 Pacific Drive for the installation of a bus shelter with a proposal to remove the tree. The motion was lost 4 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott and Billy Meehan.

Against:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb and Orphée Mickalad.

The Mayor (Grant Smith) left the meeting at 10.28am

5-24

Proposed Bus Shelter: 36 Airport Drive, Milson

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I - 15 FEBRUARY 2024

Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport.

The residents spoke to their objection and presented photos. The following additional comments were made:

- They do not object to a bus stop but a bus shelter.
- They have concerns the Council does not appear to be fixing current vandalised bus shelters in the community and hence if a shelter were erected in front of their property it would not be properly or efficiently maintained.

Officers reassured the committee that any incident reports will be promptly dealt with.

Moved William Wood, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 5-24 above was carried 5 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison and Billy Meehan.

6-24

Proposed Bus Shelter: 85 Amberley Avenue, Highbury

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery, and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport

The resident spoke to their objection and presented the aerial view of the proposed bus shelter (included in report). The following additional comments were made:

- The shelter should be moved further down the road across from the park.
- The proposed location would impede access to his driveway and this would significantly limit parking options for him and any visitors.
- The area is a high risk traffic safety area with multiple traffic incidents in the past.

The Committee resolved to lay the report on the table, to give officers time to receive and consider a Safe System Audit it had commissioned

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

as part of its response, and then report back to the Committee.

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Billy Meehan.

The **COMMITTEE RESOLVED**

1. To lie the report on the table.

Clause 6-24 above was carried 5 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

For:

Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

Councillors William Wood, Lorna Johnson and Debi Marshall-Lobb.

The meeting adjourned at 11.17am

The meeting resumed at 11.36am

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillor Pat Handcock were present when the meeting resumed at 11.36am.

7-24

Proposed Bus Shelter: 17 Featherston Street, Takaro

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport

The resident spoke to their objection and presented a document showing the layout of their house. The following additional comments were made:

- The resident has a medical condition where she uses a wheelchair and spends a significant time in her front bedroom.
- Her bedroom is located at the front of the house nearest to the footpath.
- Excessive noise triggers her condition and she is concerned with the additional noise that will be generated by people waiting at the bus stop.
- Her house is modified to accommodate her condition and therefore she cannot easily relocate to the bedroom at the rear of the house.

The Committee resolved to uphold the objection, because the impact to the resident's health significantly outweighs the need to have a bus shelter. The Committee requested officers consider relocating the bus stop from this location.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Grant Smith.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

That the Council decide not to proceed with the bus shelter at that site
– 17 Featherston Street.

Clause 7-24 above was carried 8 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Debi Marshall-Lobb and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

Councillor Patrick Handcock.

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb left the meeting at 11.57am

8-24 Proposed Bus Shelter: 292 Ruahine Street, Terrace End

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery, Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport

This objection was taken on the papers.

The Committee resolved to uphold the objection as they considered the impact to the resident's health significantly outweighs the need to have a bus shelter.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Council decide not to proceed with the bus shelter at this site – 292 Ruahine Street.

Clause 8-24 above was carried 8 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

9-24 Proposed Bus Shelter: 165 James Line, Kelvin Grove

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport.

This objection was taken on the papers.

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

Officers noted attachment 4 (aerial view of proposed shelter) was incorrect. The correct version was presented at the meeting.

Moved William Wood, seconded Lorna Johnson.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 9-24 above was carried 8 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

10-24

Proposed Bus Shelter: 552 Ruahine Street, Hokowhitu

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport.

This objection was taken on the papers.

Moved William Wood, seconded Patrick Handcock.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 10-24 above was carried 8 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

The meeting adjourned at 12.22pm

The meeting resumed at 2.02pm

Councillor Brent Barrett was present when the meeting resumed at 2.02pm

11-24

Proposed Bus Shelter: 91 Milson Line, Milson

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery and Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport.

One of the owners of the complex spoke on behalf of all the owners. He spoke to the objection and presented documents showing plans for

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

a proposed medical centre. The following additional comments were made:

- There are three issues with the proposed bus shelter location around safety, parking and future proofing.
- Safety concerns due to the high traffic use in the current facility.
- Concerns over a reduction in parking
- Concerns over a lack of future proofing for the bus network to better service the community when the planned medical centre is implemented.
- Suggested moving the bus shelter in front of the proposed medical centre, which is around 100m down from the current proposed site. This would better service the community and stop the need for it to be moved in the future when the medical centre is complete.

A second objection received was taken on the papers.

The Committee resolved to uphold the objection and propose the shelter be moved in front of the planned medical centre as this made more sense to service both current and future users.

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded William Wood.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

1. That the Council decide not to proceed with the bus shelter at that site – 91 Milson Line.

Clause 11-24 above was carried 8 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

Against:

Councillor Patrick Handcock.

12-24

Proposed Bus Shelter: 41 James Line, Kelvin Grove

Memorandum, presented by Frances Duffin, Intermediate Project Manager, Bryce Hosking, Group Manager – Property & Resource Recovery, Michael Bridge, Service Manager, Active Transport

The resident spoke to the objection but did not make any additional comments.

Moved William Wood, seconded Brent Barrett.

The **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS**

EXTRAORDINARY ECONOMIC GROWTH COMMITTEE - PART I -
15 FEBRUARY 2024

1. That Council dismiss the objection and the Chief Executive proceed with the installation of a bus shelter at this stop.

Clause 12-24 above was carried 8 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors William Wood, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Patrick Handcock.

Against:

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

Karakia Whakamutunga

Councillor William Wood closed the meeting with karakia.

The meeting finished at 2.47pm

Confirmed 28 February 2024

Chair