

# PALMERSTON NORTH CITY COUNCIL

## Minutes of the Council Meeting Part I Public, held in the Council Chamber, First Floor, Civic Administration Building, 32 The Square, Palmerston North on 29 May 2024, commencing at 9.03am

**Members Present:** The Mayor (Grant Smith) (in the Chair) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Apologies:** Councillor Debi Marshall Lobb (for lateness).

**Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb** entered the meeting at 9.07am, Wednesday 29 May 2024 before clause 89-24. She left the meeting at 5.51pm, Thursday 30 May 2024. She was not present for clauses **88-24, 95.28-24 to 95.45-24**.

**Councillor Billy Meehan** left the meeting at 10.04am, Wednesday 29 May 2024 after consideration of clause 93-24 and returned to the meeting at 10.06am Wednesday after clause 94-24. He left the meeting at 2.50pm, Wednesday 29 May 2024 during 95.9-24 and returned at 2.57pm Wednesday during clause 95.10-24. He was not present for clauses **94-24** and **95.9-24**.

**Councillor Roly Fitzgerald** left the meeting after 95.12-24 and re-entered the meeting at 10.07am, Thursday 30 May 2024 after clause 95.13-24. He left the meeting at 2.53pm, Thursday, after clause 95.20-24, entering the meeting at 3.05pm, Thursday before 95.21-24. He left the meeting after clause 95.21-24, returning at 3.40pm, Thursday after clause 95.22-24. Councillor Roly Fitzgerald left the meeting at 10.56am, Friday 31 May 2024 after clause 95.28-24. He entered the meeting again at 11.25am after clause 95.35-24. He was not present for clauses **95.13-24, 95.22-24, 95.29-24 to 95.35-24** inclusive.

**Councillor Orphée Mickalad** left the meeting at 3.20pm, Thursday 30 May 2024 after clause 95.21-24, returning at 3.40pm, Thursday after clause 95.22-24. He was not present for clause **95.22-24**.

**Councillor William Wood** re-entered the meeting at 9.40am Friday 31 May 2024. He left the meeting at 10.20am Friday after clause 95.28-24, returning at 11.19am Friday after clause 95.33-24. He was not present for clauses **95.29-24 to 95.33-24**.

**Councillor Patrick Handcock** left the meeting at 11.30am, Friday 31 May 2024 after clause 95.36-24. He was not present for clauses **95.37-24 to 95.45-24**.

**Councillor Leonie Hapeta** left the meeting at 10.40am, Friday 31 May 2024 after clause 95.28-24. She was not present for clauses **95.29-24 to 95.45-24**.

**Councillor Lew Findlay** left the meeting at 11.41am, Friday 31 May 2024 after clause 95.37-24. He was not present for clauses **95.38-24 to 95.45-24**.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

### **Karakia Timatanga**

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald opened the meeting with karakia.

### **88-24 Apologies**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Patrick Handcock.

#### **RESOLVED**

1. That Council receive the apologies.

Clause 88-24 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **Note:**

Councillor Vaughan Dennison did not vote.

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb entered the meeting at 9:07am.

### **89-24 Notification of Additional Item**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Lorna Johnson.

#### **RESOLVED**

That Council receive the late item: Submission to Parliamentary Select Committee: Māori Wards, noting the following:

**Reason for Lateness:** Knowledge of the content of the proposed bill was only introduced to Parliament on Thursday 23 May 2024.

**Reason for Urgency:** Submissions to the bill close on Wednesday 29 May 2024.

Clause 89-24 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **Note:**

Councillors Billy Meehan, Rachel Bowen and Karen Naylor did not vote.

### **90-24 Standing Orders - Option C**

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

### **RESOLVED**

That Council adopt Option C (SO 2.12.3) for the duration of this meeting.

Clause 90-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

## **91-24**

### **Confirmation of Minutes**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

### **RESOLVED**

1. That the minutes of the ordinary meeting of 15 May 2024 Part I Public be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Clause 91-24 above was carried 15 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **Abstained:**

Councillor Lew Findlay.

## **92-24**

### **Notice of Motion - Alteration of Fees and Charges for the Impounding of Animals**

Rebeka Adamson, Acting Environmental Protection Services Manager and Ross McDermott, Team Leader – Animal Management & Education presented the Officers' response.

Councillor William Wood presented the Notice of Motion. He adjusted the motion to charge a fee of \$311 which is the minimum amount recommended by Officers to cover the costs of providing the service.

Councillor Rachel Bowen moved an amendment to change the fee to \$425 which was the submitter's suggestion.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

### **RESOLVED**

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

1. That Council receive the Officer advice.

Clause 92-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Moved William Wood, seconded Mark Arnott.

### RESOLVED

2. To substitute the dog adoption fee from \$559 including de-sexing, registration, flea and worming and microchipping to instead a fee of \$425, noting the remainder of the fees set out in [Appendix 6- Attachment A](#) will remain unchanged.

Clause 92-24 above was carried 15 votes with 1 against, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against**

Councillor Karen Naylor.

**Note:**

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Lorna Johnson.

On an amendment: To substitute the dog adoption fee from \$559 including de-sexing, registration, flea and worming and microchipping to instead a fee of **\$425**, noting the remainder of the fees set out in [Appendix 6- Attachment A](#) will remain unchanged.

The amendment was carried 12 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

## 93-24

### **Deliberations on Submissions - Draft Waste Management and Minimisation Plan**

Memorandum, presented by Peter Ridge, Senior Policy Analyst, and Natasha Hickmott, Activities Manager - Resource Recovery and Sustainability.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

### RESOLVED

1. That Council receive the submissions on the draft Waste Management and Minimisation Plan 2024.
2. That Council amend action 3.6 of the draft Waste Management and Minimisation Plan 2024 to read:  
“Action 3.6 - Develop a city-wide kerbside food scraps and green waste collection service”
3. That Council amend action 3.7 of the draft Waste Management and Minimisation Plan 2024 to read:  
“Action 3.7 - Introduce residential food scraps and green waste collection and processing”
4. That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare a draft Waste Management and Minimisation Plan incorporating the changes above for presentation to the Council meeting on 26 June 2024 for adoption.

Clause 93-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

#### For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

## 94-24

### Submission to Parliamentary Select Committee: Māori Wards

Memorandum, presented by Hannah White, Democracy and Governance Manager.

Councillor Billy Meehan left the meeting at 10:04am.

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

### RESOLVED

1. That Council agree the submission as drafted (Attachment 1).

Clause 94-24 above was carried 14 votes to 0, with 1 abstention, the voting being as follows:

#### For:

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### Abstained:

Councillor Leonie Hapeta.

Councillor Billy Meehan returned to the meeting at 10:06am.

COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

- 95-24**      **Deliberations on the 2024-34 Long-Term Plan and Associated Documents**  
Memorandum, presented by David Murphy, Chief Planning Officer, Cameron McKay, Chief Financial Officer and Chris Dyhrberg, Chief Infrastructure Officer.

The Chief Financial Officer highlighted the changes in assumptions since going to consultation.

- Insurance – more expensive than initially proposed
- Revenue assumption – collecting more than initially thought
- Interest rate assumption – believe peak of interest rates has been reached and interest rates will start to fall.

Officers corrected an error in the report: the years in Tables 2, 3 and 4 should read sequentially from 2024/25 through to 2033/34.

- 1**            Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

**RESOLVED**

That Council receive submissions on the 2024-34 Long-Term Plan, noting submissions include comments on the Oranga Papaioea City Strategy and Plans, Financial and Infrastructure Strategies, Development Contributions Policy, Revenue and Financing Policy, the Rates Remission and Postponement Policies, rating system options, and the Significance and Engagement Policy.

Clause 95.1-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 10.47am

The meeting resumed at 11.05am

**RATES**

Council resolved to gradually change to a hybrid rating system of 50% land value and 50% capital value to improve fairness in the rating system.

- 3A**            Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

**RESOLVED**

That Council assume the Hybrid Rate Option of 50% LV and 50% CV in three equal steps for the next 3 years.

Clause 95.2-24 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta and William Wood.

**Note:**

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

On an amendment: That Council assume the Hybrid Rate Option of **50% 70%** LV and **50% 30%** CV in three equal steps for the next 3 years. ~~To be reviewed at next LTP in Year 4, with a view to lifting the Capital %.~~

The amendment was carried 12 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan and William Wood.

### **Discounted-Differential Rural Rate**

**3B**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **RESOLVED**

That Council change the Discounted-Differential Rural Rate from 37% over a two-year period by reducing to 30% in Year 1 and then to 25% in Year 2.

Clause 95.3-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**2A + 2B**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

#### **RESOLVED**

That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare a draft of the final Long-Term Plan for consideration by the Council and that it incorporates the following:

- a. changes to assumptions and budgets as set out in sections 5.2 – 5.5

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

- b. carry forwards of incomplete capital programmes as set out in section 5.6 and Attachment 3.

Clause 95.4-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 12.13pm

The meeting resumed at 1.19pm

### 2D (1)

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

**RESOLVED**

That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare a draft of the final Long-Term Plan for consideration by the Council and that it incorporates:

any additional Officer proposed budget changes, as follows:

- Local Water Done Well- funding sources changes (5.11)
- Freight ring road- business case forward to Year 1 (5.12)
- Kikiwhenua water planning- increase (5.13)
- Entrance programme- adjustments (5.15)
- Data refresh- decrease (5.16)
- Te Utanganui- deferral (5.17)
- Waters transition- revenue in/out (5.18)
- Growth planning technical assessments- increase (5.19)

Clause 95.5-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

### 2E

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

**RESOLVED**

That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare a draft of the final Long-Term Plan for consideration by the Council and that it incorporates an updated corporate emissions reduction target of a 2034 interim target of a 60% reduction compared to the 2015/16 baseline.

Clause 95.6-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**



## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

On a motion: That Council set annual targets for organisational and for city-wide greenhouse gas emissions that are consistent with our multi-year goals for emissions reduction.

The motion was tied 8 votes to 8. The Mayor (as Chair) declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson and Kaydee Zabelin

**Against:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

### 2F (3)

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

**RESOLVED**

That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare a draft of the final Long-Term Plan for consideration by the Council and that it incorporates any other recommendations from Committee (as follows):

- That Palmerston North City Council develop a new city-wide stormwater strategy prior to the development of the 2027 Future Development Strategy according to the budget set out in 5.23.

Clause 95.7-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

### 2F (1)

Moved Patrick Handcock, seconded Lorna Johnson.

**RESOLVED**

That Council create a new programme for youth wellbeing of \$33.3k (excluding inflation) to support youth well-being for each of years 1,2 &3 of the Long-term Plan (2024 – 34), specifically to create a youth development reference group, fund an annual youth well-being forum, and provide a pilot quick response youth development fund.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Clause 95.8-24 above was carried 14 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Leonie Hapeta and Karen Naylor.

### 2F (2)

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Lorna Johnson.

#### RESOLVED

That Council increase the funding provided to Environment Network Manawatu through the Sector Lead Partnership Agreement for the Environmental Initiatives Fund by \$30k per annum to support food security projects and inform the development of a city-wide food security and resilience policy.

Councillor Billy Meehan left the meeting at 2.50pm.

Clause 95.9-24 above was carried 8 votes to 7, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

The meeting adjourned at 3.09pm

The meeting resumed at 3.28pm

### 2D (2)

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Karen Naylor.

Councillor Billy Meehan entered the meeting again at 2.57pm.

#### RESOLVED

That Programmes 902 and 2518 are amended, deferring the proposed table set out in 5.14 by one year.

Clause 95.10-24 above was carried 14 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**Against:**

Councillor Lorna Johnson.

The meeting adjourned at 3.50pm; Council Chamber evacuated due to technical difficulties.

The meeting resumed at 4.09pm in the Missoula Room, 32 The Square, Palmerston North.

### LTP Nature Calls

**G1**

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Rachel Bowen.

#### RESOLVED

That the Nature Calls budget should be no more than \$400M (including inflation) across the 2024-34 Long-Term Plan and;

That Council instruct the Chief Executive to revisit the Best Practicable Options shortlisted options and determine if any new industry developments or alternative options could be considered as the Best Practicable Option.

**Note:** partially revoked Council 10 June 2024 (clause 111.1-24)

Clause 95.11-24 above was carried 9 votes to 7, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded Rachel Bowen.

On an amendment: That the Nature Calls budget should be no more than ~~\$480M~~ \$400M (~~excluding~~ including inflation) across the 2024-34 Long-Term Plan and that Council instruct the Chief Executive to revisit the Best Practicable Options shortlisted options and determine if any new industry developments or alternative options could be considered as the Best Practicable Option.

The amendment was carried 9 votes to 7, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**Capital Expenditure (Remove/ Decrease/ Defer)**

**G2**

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Grant Smith.

**RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive advances a piece of work to locate the proposed Multicultural Centre within the CAB, reducing Programme 2350 from \$750k to \$450k and reducing the associated operational budget from \$200k pa to \$40k pa.

Clause 95.12-24 above was carried 14 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

**The meeting adjourned at 5.06pm, Wednesday 29 May 2024.**

**The meeting resumed at 9.05am, Thursday 30 May 2024 in the Council Chamber.**

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald was not present when the meeting resumed.

**G3 (2)**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded William Wood.

**RESOLVED**

That Council reduce Programme 2057 - City-wide - Shared Pathway to a maximum of \$6M (excluding inflation) total, completing Feilding to Palmerston North City at a cost of \$2M per year in Years 1 to 3, with the Ashhurst link to be re-evaluated in Year 4.

Clause 95.13-24 above was carried 14 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

Councillor Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Rachel Bowen.

On an amendment: That Council reduce Programme 2057 - City-wide - Shared Pathway to a maximum of \$6M (excluding inflation) total, completing Feilding to Palmerston North City at a cost of \$2M per year in Years 1 to 3, ~~with the Ashhurst link to be re-evaluated in Year 4.~~

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

The amendment was lost 3 votes to 12, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen and Patrick Handcock.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock.

On a motion: That Council reduce the Palmerston North to Feilding component of Programme 2057 (City-wide - Shared Pathways - New and Link Improvements) by \$9M, and adjust investment timing to enable delivery of the Palmerston North to Feilding Shared Path by 30 June 2026.

The motion was lost 6 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald returned to the meeting at 10:07am

### G5

Moved William Wood, seconded Karen Naylor.

**RESOLVED**

That Council defer Programme 2122 – City Centre – Streets for People Upgrade in its entirety by 3 years.

Clause 95.14-24 above was carried 12 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta and Orphée Mickalad.

### G6

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded William Wood.

**RESOLVED**

That Council reduce Programme 1559 – Cycling Network Improvements to \$2.5M (excluding inflation) in years 2, 4, 6, 8, and 10, and \$250K

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

(excluding inflation) in years 1, 3, 5, 7, 9.

Clause 95.15-24 above was carried 14 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett and Patrick Handcock.

### G7

Moved William Wood, seconded Karen Naylor.

**RESOLVED**

That Council reduce Programme 2390 - City-wide - Transport - Low Cost/ Low Risk and Road to Zero to \$4M in Year one and adjust for inflation thereafter.

Clause 95.16-24 above was carried 12 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Lew Findlay and Kaydee Zabelin.

### G8

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

**RESOLVED**

That Council amend Programme 1194 – CET Arena Masterplan redevelopment to retain Barber and Bell Halls with appropriate maintenance, at the same time developing and constructing a new Arena 5 Indoor facility, spread over Years 1-3, with outer Fields redevelopment and other Masterplan projects to be deferred until Year 4 onwards and revisited at that time.

Clause 95.17-24 above was carried 12 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**Note:**

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Karen Naylor.

On an amendment: That Council amend Programme 1194 – CET Arena Masterplan redevelopment to retain Barber and Bell Halls with appropriate maintenance, ~~at the same time developing and constructing a new Arena 5 indoor facility, spread over Years 1-3,~~ with outer Fields redevelopment and other Masterplan projects to be deferred until Year 4 onwards and revisited at that time.

The amendment was tied 8 votes to 8. The Mayor (as Chair) declared the amendment lost, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

On a motion: That Council defer Programme 1763 - CET Arena property purchase to Year 5.

The motion was lost 5 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

## G10

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Karen Naylor.

### RESOLVED

That Council reduce Programme 243 - Transit Hub to \$6m (excluding inflation) per year.

Clause 95.18-24 above was carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillor Lorna Johnson.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**Note:**

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Roly Fitzgerald.

On an amendment: That Council ~~defer reduce~~ Programme 243 - Transit Hub ~~from Years 3-4 to Years 4-5 and reduce~~ to \$6m (excluding inflation) per year.

The amendment was carried 11 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

**Against:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

## G11

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

### RESOLVED

That Council defer Programme 1845 – Te Marae o Hine to Year 3 onwards.

Clause 95.19-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

On a motion: That Council reduce Programme 1846 - City Reserves - walking extensions to \$0 for Years 1 and 2.

The motion was tied 8 votes to 8. The Mayor (as Chair) declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Mark Arnott.

On a motion: That Council reduce Programme 1853 - Local Reserve Development to \$0 for Years 1 and 2.



## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

The motion was tied 8 votes to 8. The Mayor (as Chair) declared the motion lost, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Karen Naylor.

On a motion: That Council reduce Programme 1895 - Te Motu o Poutoa to \$10m with 50% council contribution (excluding inflation) and defer for one year.

The motion was lost 7 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

## G17

Moved Grant Smith, seconded William Wood.

### RESOLVED

That Council reduce Programme 2343 - Citywide - New Community Libraries/Hubs - including Awapuni, Roslyn, Te Patikitiki-Highbury to \$13M (excluding inflation) total: \$1M Year 1, \$0 Years 2 & 3, and \$3M per annum in Years 4, 5, 6, and 7, allowing budgets for: Roslyn \$1.5M, Awapuni \$8M, Te Patikitiki-Highbury \$3.5M.

Clause 95.20-24 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

**Note:**

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

On an amendment: That Council reduce Programme 2343 - Citywide - New Community Libraries/Hubs - including Awapuni, Roslyn, Te Patikitiki-Highbury to \$17M (excluding inflation) total: \$1M Year 1, \$0 Years 2 & 3, and ~~\$3M per annum in Years 4 -5 (\$5.5M each year)~~, **Y6 (\$2M), and Y7 (\$3M)**, allowing budgets for:

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Roslyn \$1.5M, Awapuni **\$12M**, Te Patikitiki-Highbury \$3.5M

The amendment was tied 8 votes to 8. The Mayor (as Chair) declared the amendment lost, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Note:**

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Orphée Mickalad.

On an amendment: That Council reduce Programme 2343 - Citywide - New Community Libraries/Hubs - including Awapuni, Roslyn, Te Patikitiki-Highbury to **\$15M** (excluding inflation) total: \$1M Year 1, \$0 Years 2 & 3, and ~~\$3M per annum~~ **in Years 4 -5 (\$4.5M each year), Y6 (\$2M), and Y7 (\$3M)**, allowing budgets for: Roslyn \$1.5M, Awapuni \$10M, Te Patikitiki-Highbury \$3.5M

The amendment was tied 8 votes to 8. The Mayor (as Chair) declared the amendment lost, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

### **Operational Expenditure - Remove/Decrease/Defer**

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald left the meeting at 2.53pm.

**Note:**

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Karen Naylor.

On a motion: That Council reduce the funding allocation for staff remuneration to provide a 6% increase in Year 1 with a minimum of \$400K of this reduction to be applied to rates funded remuneration.

The motion was lost 4 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

On a motion: That Council reduce Programme 2451 - Leadership Development to \$50K (excluding inflation) in Years 1, 2 and 3.

The motion was lost 4 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald entered the meeting at 3.05pm.

## G22

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Karen Naylor.

**RESOLVED**

That Council reduce the funding for Professional services by \$1m in Year 1 and 2.

Clause 95.21 -24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Karen Naylor.

On a motion: That Council defer Programme 1949 - Civic and Cultural Precinct to start in Year 4.

The motion was lost 1 vote to 12, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillor Karen Naylor.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison and Billy Meehan did not vote.

The meeting adjourned at 3.20pm.

The meeting resumed at 3.38pm.

Councillors Roly Fitzgerald and Orphée Mickalad were not present when the meeting resumed.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

### **Extension of Meeting**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Debi Marshall-Lobb.

### **RESOLVED**

That Council extend the meeting until 6.00pm.

Clause 95.22-24 above was carried 13 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **Against:**

Councillor Lorna Johnson.

Councillors Roly Fitzgerald and Orphée Mickalad entered the meeting at 3.40pm.

## **G25**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded William Wood.

### **RESOLVED**

That Council defer Programme 764 - Energy use monitoring from Years 3, 5 & 6 to Years 4, 6 & 7.

Clause 95.23-24 above was carried 16 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Grant Smith.

On a motion: That Council reduce Programme 2450 - Homelessness Response to \$130k (excluding inflation) in Years 1, 2 and 3 to fund Housing First and Flexi Fund initiatives.

The motion was lost 6 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

#### **For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

#### **Against:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **Note:**

Moved William Wood, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

On an amendment: That Council reduce Programme 2450 - Homelessness

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Response to ~~\$50k~~ \$130k (excluding inflation) in Years 1, 2 and 3 to fund Housing First and Flexi Fund initiatives.

The amendment was carried 12 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson and Orphée Mickalad.

### G27

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

#### RESOLVED

That Council reduce Programme 1447 - Earthquake Prone Heritage building fund to \$75K (excluding inflation) in Year 1, \$76K (excluding inflation) in Year 2 and \$78K (excluding inflation) in Year 3.

Clause 95.24-24 above was carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith).

**Note:**

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Karen Naylor.

On a motion: That Council remove Programme 2519 - Artificial Football field - Year 2 \$867K.

The motion was lost 6 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

### G29

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Karen Naylor.

#### RESOLVED

That Council remove Programme 2523 - Community Pool Grants \$100k in Years 1-3.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Clause 95.25-24 above was carried 15 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillor Debi Marshall-Lobb.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

On a motion: That Council remove Programme 2525 - Central District Hinds.

The motion was lost 4 votes to 12, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and William Wood.

**Note:**

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Leonie Hapeta.

On a motion: That Council defer Programme 2417 - Caccia Birch Masterplan \$54K (excluding inflation) from Year 1 to Year 4.

The motion was lost 5 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

## G32

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Karen Naylor.

### RESOLVED

That Council remove Programme 2488 - Business Sustainability Fund.

Clause 95.26-24 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved William Wood, seconded Billy Meehan.

On a motion: That the Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation operational budget total be amended to \$726k in year one and adjusted for inflation in each year after.

The motion was lost 5 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

### **Capital Expenditure - Add/Increase/Bring Forward**

**G35**

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Lorna Johnson.

### **RESOLVED**

That Council bring forward \$300k from Programme 1786 - Recreational Buildings - Sports Pavilion and Changing Room Renewals from years 4 – 6 to years 1 – 3, for renewals for changing room and park facilities identified as being in 'poor condition.'

Clause 95.27-24 above was carried 13 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Leonie Hapeta, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott and Karen Naylor.

**The meeting adjourned Thursday, 30 May 2024 at 5.51pm.**

**The meeting resumed Friday, 31 May 2024 at 9.03am.**

Councillors Debi Marshall-Lobb and William Wood were not present when the meeting resumed.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Mark Arnott.

On a motion: That Council amend Te Manawa operational grant funding to: Year 1 \$3,756,899, Year 2 \$3,855,537, Year 3 \$3,963,012.

The motion was lost 4 votes to 10, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Councillors Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan and Karen Naylor.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

### **Operational Expenditure - Add/Increase/Bring forward**

Councillor William Wood entered the meeting at 9.40am.

**G36**

Moved Lorna Johnson, seconded Patrick Handcock.

### **RESOLVED**

That Council increase funding for Strategic Priority Grants by 10% each year in years 1 to 3. This figure to be used plus CPI adjustments from year 2.

Clause 95.28-24 above was carried 11 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Note:**

Moved Vaughan Dennison, seconded Karen Naylor.

On an amendment: That Council increase funding for Strategic Priority Grants by ~~30% (\$453k)~~ **10% (\$151K)** in year 1. This figure to be used plus CPI adjustments from year 2.

The amendment was lost 6 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Rachel Bowen.

On an amendment: That Council increase funding for Strategic Priority Grants by ~~10% (\$151k) in year 1~~ **each year in years 1 to 3**. This figure to be used plus CPI adjustments from year 2.

The amendment was carried 11 votes to 4, the voting being as follows:

**For:**



## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Leonie Hapeta, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded William Wood.

On an amendment: That Council increase funding for Strategic Priority Grants by 10% each year in years 1 to 3 **including CPI**. ~~This figure to be used plus CPI adjustments from year 2.~~

The amendment was lost 6 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta, Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Leonie Hapeta, seconded William Wood.

On a motion: That Council support \$20k in year 1 only, for the Manawatū Business Chamber Business Voice and Response Strategic Project.

The motion was lost 4 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Vaughan Dennison, Leonie Hapeta and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

The meeting adjourned at 10.20am.

The meeting resumed at 10.40am.

Councillors Leonie Hapeta and William Wood were not present when the meeting resumed.

**Note:**

Moved Orphée Mickalad, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

On a motion: That Council create a new programme of \$50k annually for the provision of civics education initiatives in the community, noting that these education initiatives will target all groups, not just schools.

The motion was lost 2 votes to 11, the voting being as follows:

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**For:**

Councillors Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan and Karen Naylor.

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald left the meeting at 10.56am.

### **G40**

Moved Orphée Mickalad, seconded Kaydee Zabelin.

#### **RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive (a) develop key civics indicators to report against, and (b) provide a progress report annually to assess the effectiveness of the civics education initiatives.

Clause 95.29-24 above was carried 10 votes to 2, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillors Mark Arnott and Karen Naylor.

### **G41**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Rachel Bowen.

#### **RESOLVED**

That Council contribute a grant towards the development and construction of a new Covered Bowling Green at Palmerston North Bowling Club of a total contribution of \$450,000 (excluding inflation) over two years: \$225,000 Year 3 and then \$225,000 Year 4.

Clause 95.30-24 above was carried 9 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson and Billy Meehan.

**Against:**

Councillors Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

### **G42**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

#### **RESOLVED**

That Council fund Palmerston North Surf Life Saving Club \$15,000 per annum Years 2 to 3.

Clause 95.31-24 above was carried 7 votes to 5, the voting being as follows:

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

**Against:**

Councillors Rachel Bowen, Lew Findlay, Lorna Johnson, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

### G43

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Lorna Johnson.

**RESOLVED**

That Council give civic support to the New Zealand Rugby Museum International Australian exhibition to the value of \$10k in year 1.

Clause 95.32-24 above was carried 9 votes to 3, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan and Orphée Mickalad.

**Against:**

Councillors Brent Barrett, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**LTP Other**

### G44

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Lorna Johnson.

**RESOLVED**

That Council add "Community social service groups and facilities that are well supported and invested in" to Goal 3 outcomes; and "Natural environment-focused community groups and facilities that are well supported and invested in" to Goal 4 outcomes.

Clause 95.33-24 above was carried 10 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Pat Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillor Billy Meehan.

**Note:**

Councillor Mark Arnott did not vote.

Councillor William Wood entered the meeting at 11:19am.

### G45

Moved Brent Barrett, seconded Patrick Handcock.

**RESOLVED**

That Council endorse the City to Sea shared path proposal, noting no

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

financial support is committed.

Clause 95.34-24 above was carried 12 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillor Lew Findlay.

### **G46**

Moved Patrick Handcock, seconded Lorna Johnson.

#### **RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive provide a youth well-being and youth development progress report annually.

Clause 95.35-24 above was carried 13 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald entered the meeting at 11.25am.

### **G47**

Moved Patrick Handcock, seconded Lorna Johnson.

#### **RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive provide a report to Council outlining property options in Roslyn, requested by ACROSS and Roslyn REACH, to support delivery of community services. The report should include a full review of existing and relevant reports to summarise the needs identified and to inform what the next steps would be, which might include a feasibility study and or engagement.

Clause 95.36-24 above was carried 14 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Patrick Handcock, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

Councillor Patrick Handcock left the meeting at 11.30am.

### **G48**

Moved Kaydee Zabelin, seconded Lorna Johnson.

#### **RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive review the community garden guidelines and

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

rules to be more permissive and encouraging for groups starting a community garden on public land.

Clause 95.37-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Vaughan Dennison, Lew Findlay, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Councillor Rachel Bowen did not vote.

Councillor Lew Findlay left the meeting at 11.41am.

### **G49**

Moved Rachel Bowen, seconded Grant Smith.

**RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive ensures that, in projects where partner funding is required, Council undertakes no physical works until external funding is committed unless Council determines otherwise (excluding NZTA).

Clause 95.38-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

### **G50**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Rachel Bowen.

**RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive create a City Heritage Plan out of existing resources that can be built on in future years, as per Submissions 688 & 1037.

Clause 95.39-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

### **G51**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Rachel Bowen.

**RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive create a volunteer City Heritage Advisory or Reference Group that can be built on in future years, as per Submissions

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

688 & 1037.

Clause 95.40-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

### G52

Moved William Wood, seconded Grant Smith.

**RESOLVED**

That Council grant \$10,000, in Year 1 only, to engage with the Te Awa Community Foundation for a civic fund for the Palmerston North City area.

Clause 95.41-24 above was carried 11 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) did not vote.

### 2G

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Rachel Bowen.

**RESOLVED**

That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare a final draft of the Long-Term Plan for consideration by the Council and that it incorporates **the above** motions as a result of public consultation as determined by this meeting of Council.

Clause 95.42-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

### 6

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Rachel Bowen.

**RESOLVED**

That in preparing the draft of the final Long-Term Plan 2024/34, the Chief Executive revise the timing of the present provisions for accelerated debt repayment so that they continue to total approximately \$150m over ten years, but that they smooth the impact on rates in a more strategic manner.

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

Clause 95.43-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Note:**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded William Wood.

On an amendment: That in preparing the draft of the final Long-Term Plan 2024/34, the Chief Executive revise the timing of the present provisions for accelerated debt repayment ~~so that they continue~~ to total approximately \$75m over ten years, but that they smooth the impact on rates in a more strategic manner.

The amendment was lost 3 votes to 9, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

Councillors Billy Meehan, Karen Naylor and William Wood.

**Against:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Orphée Mickalad and Kaydee Zabelin.

**7**

Moved Karen Naylor, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

**RESOLVED**

That the Chief Executive provide a report to model and provide \$75M debt repayment over 10 Years to Council on 10 June 2024

Clause 95.44-24 above was carried 11 votes to 1, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Against:**

Councillor Lorna Johnson.

**4 + 5**

Moved Grant Smith, seconded Vaughan Dennison.

**RESOLVED**

4. That Council instruct the Chief Executive to prepare updated drafts of the Oranga Papaioea City Strategy and Plans, Financial and Infrastructure Strategies, Development Contributions Policy, Revenue and Financing Policy and Rates Remission and Postponement Policies incorporating any changes consequential on the recommendations above for consideration by the Council.

5. That Council call an extraordinary meeting on Monday 10 June 2024

## COUNCIL - PART I - 29 MAY 2024

at 9am, Council Chambers 32 Te Marae o Hine, The Square to consider the final draft Long-Term Plan 2024/34. 12/0

Clause 95.45-24 above was carried 12 votes to 0, the voting being as follows:

**For:**

The Mayor (Grant Smith) and Councillors Mark Arnott, Brent Barrett, Rachel Bowen, Vaughan Dennison, Roly Fitzgerald, Lorna Johnson, Billy Meehan, Orphée Mickalad, Karen Naylor, William Wood and Kaydee Zabelin.

**Karakia Whakamutunga**

Councillor Roly Fitzgerald closed the meeting with karakia.

The meeting finished at 12.17pm, Friday 31 May 2024

Confirmed 10 June 2024

**Mayor**